

UNSUCCESSFUL ATTEMPT TO DENY THE INSTALLATION OF IMAM 'Ali (FROM YEMEN TO GHADIR)

A critique on the distortion of the meaning of Hadith Ghadir by some Sunni scholars and the adaptation of Saudi Wahhabis from them

Javad Muhaddithi

Quran and Hadith Science Ph.D. and Director of Cultural Research, Tehran
Azad University

Jan 2022

Abstract: *The subject of this article is the investigation and analysis of one of the conspiracies of the opponents to distort Ghadir's message. Based on this, the author first examines the event of Ghadir Khum and its relationship with the principle of Imamate from the point of view of Saudi Wahhabism, and then by examining the sources for this matter, he lists the distortions made in it.*

Keywords: *Distortion of Ghadir's message, Denial of installation (appointment) of imam, Ghadir Khum, Imamate of Hazrat Ali (peace be upon him), Yemen.*

Introduction

The eloquent and radiant truth of Ghadir Khum has stood out so much throughout history that the full-fledged opponents of the master of Ghadir and Ghadir's message have never had the power to cover it up. However, they have been effective in limiting this message. The amazing brilliance of Ghadir, despite the all-round confrontation of the opponents, has a special historical aspect and requires an independent investigation. In this article, we will examine and analyze one of the conspiracies of the opponents to distort Ghadir's message; A conspiracy that may be considered the last shot of those truth-hiding ones. Of course, mentioning this suspicion is preceded by some issues that we will mention and we will show the traces of partialities there as well.

Seeing the fruitless attempts to distort and deny a truth inevitably increases our confidence in that truth.

Saudi Wahhabism: "The event of Ghadir Khum and its relationship with the principle of Imamate"

The above title may be a bit strange; but the phrase in quotation marks is the title of a brochure that was distributed by the Saudi Wahhabis to Iranian pilgrims of the Holy shrines a few years ago.[2] In the text of this brochure, the story of the trip that Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him, had to Yemen before the Hajj al-Wida' was mentioned, and in its continuation, it is stated:

A....Hazrat 'Ali (RA) left Yemen. The companions asked him to rest their camels and ride on the camels that were taken as booty [correct interpretation: was received as zakat[3]]. 'Ali (ra) forbade them.

B. Then Ali (R.A.) appointed a successor for himself and went early to reach the Hajj (Farewell Hajj) ceremony.

C. Ali's successor (R.A.) gave each of his companions a linen garment and allowed them to ride on camels taken as booty [for zakat]. 'Ali (RA) returned to them after completing the Hajj and took the clothes and camels from the people and became angry with his deputy and blamed him for what he did. Grievances and complaints appeared among the army and they opposed Ali.and

D. When they reached the Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him, they announced their complaint about Ali's behavior. In this way, what 'Ali had done was spread among the companions of the Prophet (PBUH) and the word against 'Ali (RA) increased.

Baridah says: When I reached the Prophet, may God bless him and grant him peace, I criticized Ali's work and told him his faults until I saw the face of the Prophet, may God bless

him and grant him peace, change, and he said: Am I not superior among the believers than themselves? I said: Yes. Then he said: "من كنت مولاه فعلى مولاه"

E. Then the Prophet, may God bless him and grant him peace, stood up among us and said, "O people! Do not complain about Ali. By God, he is more poiuis than being sued."

F. Zeyd bin Arqam (RA) says: "One day, in a place between Mecca and Medina called "Khum", the Prophet stood among us and gave praise and thanks to God, and after some sermons and reminders, said: "O people! I am a human being like you, and I may respond to the call of Malik al-Mut (the angel of death) at any moment; but I will leave two precious things among you; one is the book of God, in which there is guidance and light; so take it and hold on to it." And he urged and encouraged us towards the Qur'an and continued: "And the second is my Ahl al-Bayt; I warn you

about them - he repeated this three times.”

The author of the brochure, after presenting other topics, returns to the above topic and expresses his desired result as follows:

G.The meaning of Ghadir's narration - if you pay attention to the beginning of the story or narration - becomes clear that there was a dispute between ‘Ali (RA) and his army, and after returning from Hajj, when they reached the Prophet of God again, they complained and criticized ‘Ali (RA) a lot and this argument was spread among the people until the Prophet, peace and blessings of God be upon him, deemed it necessary to disembark in this place [Ghadir Khum] despite the hot weather and exonerate ‘Ali (RA) with his statements. Therefore, speaking of allegiance to anyone from far or near for the caliphate was not an issue.

Examining the sources mentioned for the above article

Discovering the distortions made

For the text above the names of several sources are mentioned: Fath al-Bari, Musnad Ahmad, Sahih Muslim, Mustadrak Hakim, Majma’ al-Zawa’id Heythami and Al-Badayah va Al-Nahayah.

Referring to the latter source shows that the story was adapted from Ibn Kathir Dameshqi (the author of Al-Badayah va Al-Nahayah). Ibn Kathir also quoted from Sirah Ibn Ishaq (an old source that is one of the most important historical sources of Sunnis in the biography of the Messenger of God, may God bless him and grant him peace), but at the same time he made some distortions. Since Ibn Ishaq's Sirah is not available today, we first mention the matter by quoting Ibn Hisham's Sirah - which he also quoted from Ibn Ishaq - so that the distortion of Ibn Kathir can be seen in

comparison.

فوالله إنّه لأخشن في ذات الله (أو في سبيل الله) من أن يشكي.

Narration of the Sirah of Ibn Hisham concerning the event of Yemen

Ibn Hisham writes in his Sirah, quoting Ibn Ishaq's Sirah:

لما أقبل على - رضي الله عنه - من اليمن ليلقى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم سلم بمكة، فعجل إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم و استخلف على جنده الذين معه رجلاً من أصحابه، فعمد ذلك الرجل فكسا كل رجل من القوم حلة من البز الذي كان مع علي - رضي الله عنه - فلما دنا جيشه خرج ليلقاهم؛ فإذا عليهم الحلل، قال: ويلك ما هذا؟! قال: كسوت القوم ليتجملوا به إذا قدموا في الناس. قال: ويلك انزع قبل أن تنتهي به إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم. قال: فانتزع الحلل من الناس فردها في البز، قال وأظهر الجيش شكواه لما صنع بهم.

قال ابن إسحاق [سلسلة سند] عن أبي سعيد الخدري، قال: اشتكى الناس علياً رضوان الله عليه، فقام رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم فينا خطيباً، فسمعتة يقول: أيها الناس، لا تشكوا علياً،

قال ابن إسحاق: ثم مضى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم على حجّه، فأرى الناس مناسكهم و أعلمهم سنن حجهم.¹

When Hazrat 'Ali (peace be upon him) moved from Yemen to Mecca to meet the Messenger of God (peace be upon him), he was in a hurry to meet the Messenger of God (peace be upon him); he appointed one of his Companions to replace him in the army. That person hastened and gave the soldiers the clothes that were in the possession of Hazrat 'Ali (as) [as zakat or booty].

When the army approached Mecca, the Prophet came out of the city to meet them; suddenly he saw the clothes they were wearing and said (to the commander he had assigned): Woe to you! What is this situation? He said: I gave them the clothes so that when they enter the city, they look elegant.”

His holiness said, “Woe to you, take off these clothes before we reach the Messenger of God, may God bless him and grant him peace.” So he took off the clothes and put them back, and the soldiers complained because of this.

Ibn Ishaq narrates from Abu Sa’id Khudri who said, “People complained about ‘Ali, may Allah be pleased with him; So the Messenger of God, may God bless him and grant him peace, stood up to speak among us, so I heard him say, “O people! Don't complain about ‘Ali because he is so serious about divine affairs that to be sued.” Ibn Ishaq says:

Then the Messenger of God, may God's prayers and peace be upon him, finished speaking about this issue and started his Hajj. So he taught the rituals to the people and taught them the practices of Hajj.”

As it can be seen, Ibn Hisham asserted that the people who sent to Yemen complained about ‘Ali (peace

be upon him) to the Messenger of God, and the Holy Prophet (peace and blessings of God be upon him) gave a speech in response to the complaints and defended the Commander of the Faithful ‘Ali (peace be upon him). After that, the Holy Prophet was engaged in Hajj rituals and taught Muslims about Hajj.

According to this narration, the complaint against Amir al-Mu'minin ‘Ali, peace be upon him, and the reaction of the Messenger of God, peace be upon him, and the speech in defense of the Imam, peace be upon him, were made before the performance of Hajj - that is, at least ten days before Ghadir Khum.

Ibn Kathir's narration of the story of Yemen and his distortions

Ibn Kathir Dameshqi - the one whose text we are discussing is based on his narration - has narrated the report from Ghadir as follows:

فصل في إيراد الحديث الدالّ على أنه عليه السلام
 خطب بمكان بين مكة والمدينة مرجعة من حجة
 الوداع قريب من الجحفة - يقال له غدِير خم - فبيّن
 فيها فضل علي بن أبي طالب وبراءة عرضه مما
 كان تكلم فيه بعض من كان معه بأرض اليمن،
 بسبب ما كان صدر منه إليهم من المعدلة التي ظلّها
 بعضهم جوراً و تضييقاً و بخلأ والصواب كان معه
 في ذلك، و لهذا لما تفرّغ صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم
 من بيان المناسك و رجع إلى المدينة بيّن ذلك في
 أثناء الطريق، فخطب خطبة عظيمة في اليوم
 الثامن عشر من ذي الحجة عامئذ و كان يوم الأحد
 بغدير خم تحت شجره هناك، فبيّن فيها أشياء و
 ذكر من فضل علي و أمانته و عدله و قربه إليه ما
 أزاح به ما كان في نفوس كثير من الناس منه؛²

A chapter in the narration of a
 hadith that shows that the Messenger
 of God, peace and blessings of God be
 upon him, gave a speech on his return
 from the Hajj of Farewell, in a place
 between Mecca and Medina, near
 Juhfah, which is called Ghadir Khum,
 and in it, he expressed the superiority
 of 'Ali ibn Abi Talib (peace be upon
 him) and the fact that he was exempt
 from the words that some of the

companions of Yemen had said about
 him, and the reason for these words
 was the justice that [his majesty
 exercised, but] some of them thought
 it was oppression and improper
 strictness and stinginess, but the
 correct opinion was his [Ali's (peace
 be upon him)] opinion; For this
 reason, when the Messenger of God,
 may God bless him and grant him
 peace, was free from performing
 rituals and was returning to Medina,
 on the way, on the 18th day of Dhil
 Hajjah, he delivered a great sermon,
 and that was on Sunday under a tree in
 Ghadir. The Messenger of God, may
 God bless him and grant him peace,
 made some statements in that speech
 and mentioned the virtue of 'Ali bin
 Abi Talib, peace be upon him, his
 trust, justice, and his high position in
 his eyes in such a way that what had
 arisen in the hearts of many people
 towards him was resolved.

As you can see, from the
 beginning, Ibn Kathir considered

Ghadir's speech - which he referred to as a great speech - to be related to the complaints of some of the people sent to Yemen, and of course, in the next few lines, you will see what distortions he did.

Like Ibn Hisham, he also narrated the story of the Yemeni companions' complaint against Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him, from Sirah Ibn Ishaq and only removed one sentence from the end (!) and other initiatives that we will describe in detail. Since Ibn Kathir's quote - except for the last sentences that have been censored- is completely similar to the quote that we brought from Ibn Hisham's saying, we only repeat its summary and then remind the deleted sentences:

لما أقبل على رضي الله عنه من اليمن ليلقي رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم سلم بمكة، تعجل إلى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم و استخلف على جنده فلما دنا جيشه خرج ليلقاهم؛ فإذا

عليهم الحل، قال: ويلك ما هذا؟ ... قال ابن إسحق [سلسلة سند] عن أبي سعيد الخدري، قال: اشتكى الناس علياً رضوان الله عليه، فقام رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم فينا خطيباً، فسمعتة يقول: أيها الناس! لا تشكروا علياً، فوالله إنّه لأخشن في ذات الله (أو في سبيل الله) من أن يشكي.

In this part of Ibn Ishaq's Sirah, Ibn Kathir has omitted these sentences:

قال ابن إسحاق: ثم مضى رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم على حجه، فأرى الناس مناسكهم و أعلمهم سنن حجهم.

The above sentences were present in the narration of Ibn Hisham's Sirah from Ibn Ishaq's Sirah - which was narrated earlier; but they were censored in Ibn Kathir's narration. This is the beginning of the distortion that has taken place by him.

Ibn Kathir's distortions

1.As we have seen, the sentence omitted by Ibn Kathir indicates the fact that the Messenger of God, peace and blessings be upon

him, did not talk any more about this issue after giving a speech in defense of Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him, and engaged in the rituals of Hajj and teaching the rituals to the people. This distortion is to minimize the time gap between Ghadir's speech and the incident of the complaint, so that the alleged connection between these two issues seems more natural.

We will talk more about this distortion.

2.Ibn Kathir, immediately after saying that the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of God be upon him, gave a speech and said: "Don't complain about 'Ali; because he is very serious in the divine affairs", narrates a tradition by emphasizing its authenticity saying that Boraidah Aslami said:

غزوت مع علي اليمن فرأيت منه جفوة؛ فلما قدمت على رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم ذكرت

علياً فتتقصته فرأيت وجه رسول الله يتغير. فقال: يا بريدة! أأنت أولى بالمؤمنين من أنفسهم؟ قلت: بلى يا رسول الله. قال: من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه؛³

I accompanied 'Ali bin Abi Talib, peace be upon him, in a war in Yemen, and I saw a harsh treatment from him. So, when I visited the Messenger of God, may God bless him and grant him peace, I found fault with 'Ali, peace be upon him; but I saw that the Prophet's face changed [out of anger] and he said, "O Boraidah! Have I not more right over the believers than they have?" I said, "Yes, O Messenger of God." So he said, "Whoever I am his master, 'Ali is his master."

This is despite the fact that Boraidah's complaint against the Commander of the Faithful 'Ali, peace be upon him, is not basically related to the journey before Hajj al-Wida' (Farewell Hajj). Rather, it happened before that, on the sidelines of the Prophet's first trip to Yemen. In this

trip, the trib of Hamedan converted to Islam.⁴

It is noticed that in the words of Ibn Kathir, the words of Boraidah have been quoted as follows: " غزوت مع علي اليمن"; This phrase shows that this trip was the first mission of Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him, to Yemen because the journey before Hajj al-Wida' was to collect zakat not war.⁵

During the first trip, Khalid bin Walid and another group, including Boraidah, joined forces against Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him, and after that, Boraidah filed a complaint against 'Ali in Medina. Therefore, this issue has nothing to do with the Ghadir Khum.

The answer of the Holy Prophet, may God's prayers and peace be upon him, was logically sharp and severe, and according to numerous sources of the Sunnis, he addressed

Boraidah and others with phrases like this:

لا تقع في علي فإنه مني و أنا منه و هو وليكم
بعدي⁶

Do not backbite 'Ali for he is from me and I am from Him, and he is your master after I.

من كنت وليه فعلي وليه⁷ ما تريدون من علي؟ علي
مئتي وأنا من علي و علي ولي كل مؤمن بعدي⁸

Or as it was mentioned in Ibn Kathir's narration and Hakim also narrated it and considered it to be correct:

ألست أولى بالمؤمنين من أنفسهم؟ قلت: بلى يا
رسول الله قال: من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه⁹.

Ibn Kathir mixed this incident with the incident related to Hajj al-Wida' so that the above-mentioned interpretations - which are included in it - provide the ground for tying Yemen's complaints to Ghadir's speech.

3. In order to complete the above-mentioned distortion, Ibn Kathir immediately quotes another quote from the words of Zayd bin Arqam, which his master Dhahabi confirmed as being correct:

لَمَّا رَجَعَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ مِنْ حَجَّةِ الْوَدَاعِ وَ نَزَلَ غَدِيرِ
خَمٍ أَمَرَ بِدَوْحَاتٍ فَمَقَمْنَ. قَالَ: كَأَنِّي قَدْ دَعَيْتُ
فَأَجَبْتُ، إِنِّي قَدْ تَرَكْتُ فِيكُمْ الثَّقَلَيْنِ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَ
عَثَرَتِي أَهْلَ بَيْتِي، فَانظُرُوا كَيْفَ تَخْلَفُونِي فِيهِمَا؛
فَإِنَّهُمَا لَنْ يَفْتَرِقَا حَتَّى يَرِدَا عَلِيَّ الْحَوْضَ. ثُمَّ قَالَ:
اللَّهُ مَوْلَايَ وَأَنَا وَلِيَّ كُلِّ مُؤْمِنٍ؛ ثُمَّ أَخَذَ بِيَدِ عَلِيٍّ
فَقَالَ: مَنْ كُنْتُ مَوْلَاهُ فَهَذَا وَلِيُّهُ؛ اللَّهُمَّ وَالِ مَنْ وَالَاهُ
وَعَادَ مِنْ عَادَاهُ؛¹⁰

When the Messenger of God, may God's prayers and peace be upon him, was returning from Farewell Hajj, he landed in Ghadir Khum and ordered that some tents be erected. Then he said, "It is as if I have been called [to the other world] and I have accepted. Indeed, I have left two precious things among you; the book of God and my 'Itrat, my family; So

wach out how you treat those two after me, these two do not separate from each other until they reach me next to Kuthar pond." Then he took the hand of 'Ali (peace be upon him) and said, "Whoever I am his master, 'Ali is his master. Oh God! Love anyone who loves him and hate whoever hates him".

Ibn Kathir then narrates several ways for Ghadir's hadith; including he immediately quotes from the Sunan of Ibn Majah - from Sihih - with the mention of a chain of transmission from Bara' bin 'Azib, a companion of the Messenger of God, peace and blessings be upon him:

: أَقْبَلْنَا مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَآلِهِ
وَسَلِمَ فِي حَجَّةِ الْوَدَاعِ الَّتِي حَجَّ فَنَزَلَ فِي الطَّرِيقِ،
فَأَمَرَ: الصَّلَاةَ جَامِعَةً فَأَخَذَ بِيَدِ عَلِيٍّ فَقَالَ: أَلَسْتُ
بِأَوْلَى بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ مِنْ أَنْفُسِهِمْ؟ قَالُوا: بَلَى. قَالَ: أَلَسْتُ
بِأَوْلَى بِكُلِّ مُؤْمِنٍ مِنْ نَفْسِهِ؟ قَالُوا: بَلَى. قَالَ: فَهَذَا
وَلِيِّ مَنْ أَنَا مَوْلَاهُ؛ اللَّهُمَّ وَالِ مَنْ وَالَاهُ وَ عَادَ مِنْ
عَادَاهُ؛¹¹

We were with the Messenger of God, may God bless him and grant him peace, during the farewell Hajj. His Majesty stopped on the way and had public congregational prayers. Then he took 'Ali's hand and said, "Do I not have more authority over the believers than they do themselves?" Everyone said, Yes. [Again] He said, "Do I not have more authority over every believer than he himself?" They said: Yes. Then he said: So this person is the guardian of anyone for whom I am his master. God! love whoever loves him, and hate whoever hates him.

As you can see, Ibn Kathir, immediately after quoting a part of speech of Aslami, regarding the anger and reaction of the Messenger of God, peace and blessings be upon him, narrates the Hadith of Ghadir in several ways, so that naturally, the audience suspects that these two are the same, and the reactions of the Holy Prophet, may God bless him and grant

him peace, to complaints is the same speech of Ghadir khum.

Therefore, what Ibn Kathir narrated from Ibn Ishaq includes the Amir al-Mu'minin, peace be upon him, questioning the people sent to Yemen, their complaints to the Messenger of God, peace and blessings be upon him, and the speech of the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings be upon him, in defense of the Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him. And what he has omitted includes this statement of Ibn Ishaq who said, "After these incidents, the Holy Prophet, may God bless him and grant him peace, engaged in the rituals of Hajj and taught the practices of Hajj to Muslims." He then immediately recounted Ghadir's hadith.

It became clear how much the removal of the mentioned phrases was necessary for Ibn Kathir to reach his goal. If he quoted the censored parts and it turned out that the speech of the

Messenger of God, may God bless him and grant him peace, in response to the complainants, was given in Mecca and before the Hajj rituals - while the incident of Ghadir and the narration of its famous hadith occurred a few days after Hajj rites have taken place - there remained no justification for the claim that Ghadir's speech was for the same reason.

Other problems with Ibn Kathir

In the sentences quoted from the Holy Prophet, peace and blessings of God be upon him, which he said in response to complaints about Hazrat 'Ali, peace be upon him, in the sources of the sunnites, there are phrases such as: "Do not complain about 'Ali, peace be upon him", and...; but Ibn Kathir, or anyone else who wants to link Ghadir's speech to the complaints of the Yemen story, should explain that in Ghadir's speech, what proof is there to assert the connection between the

speech and the complaint against Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him?! In no part of Ghadir's speech, there is no sentence that relates the issue to the complaint of people against Hazrat 'Ali (peace be upon him).

Ibn Kathir says that the Messenger of God, gave a great speech in Ghadir Khum. Sunni sources and he himself have quoted only a little of this long speech - the details of which are given in Shiite sources; but in this summary that we brought from his own words, there are signs to understand the truth; the fact that the Holy Prophet informs of his approaching demise before saying, "من كنت مولاه فهذا وليه، اللهم وال من والاه وعاد من عاداه." doesn't mean that the Prophet was trying to express an important will for the population of several tens of thousands of Muslims in Ghadir Khum? Is the statement of the hadith of Thaqaalayn and the emphasis on the inseparable companionship of the Ahl al-Bayt (peace be upon them) with the

Book of God until the Day of Judgment, just a reaction to the actions of people who complained about ‘Ali (as)?

According to the brief narration of the mentioned authors, the Prophet before saying the sentences

من كنت مولاه فهذا وليه، اللهم وال من

والاه وعاد من عاداه

reminds his highest divine position, that is, "having authority over the believers more than they themselves" (the content of the sixth verse of Surah Al-Ahzab) and got present people confirmed this. Does reminding of such a position mean not to simply complain about ‘Ali (peace be upon him) and to love him?

In this discussion, there is another interesting point, which we present in other forms to Ibn Kathir in the discussion of Ghadir; In the continuation of what was mentioned,

in the fifth volume of Al-Badāyah wa Al-Nahāyah, he has given:

...دعا رسول الله صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم علياً وأخذ بيده فأقامه عن يمينه فقال: أأست أولى بكل امرئ من نفسه؟ قالوا: بلى. قال: فإن هذا مولى من أنا مولاه؛ اللهم وال من والاه وعاد من عاداه. فلقية عمر بن الخطاب فقال: هنيئاً لك، أصبحت و أمسيت مولى كل مؤمن و مؤمنة؛

... The Messenger of God, may God bless him and grant him peace, called ‘Ali, peace be upon him, took his hand and positioned him on his right side, and said: Do I not have more authority over everyone than himself? They said: Yes. He said: This ‘Ali is the master of everyone, and I am his master. God! love whoever loves him, and hate whoever hates him. So ‘Umar bin Khattab met that majesty and said: be this sweet on you. You have become my master and master of every Muslim man and woman.

In the seventh volume, he also narrates the hadiths of Ghadir in detail, and

among them, there is a hadith which was narrated from Abu Hurairah with the mention of the chain of transmission:

...يوم غدير خم لما أخذ النبي صلى الله عليه وآله وسلم بيد علي بن أبي طالب فقال: أأنت ولي المؤمنين؟ قالوا: بلى يا رسول الله! قال: من كنت مولاه فعلي مولاه. فقال عمر بن الخطاب: بخ بخ لآ يا ابن أبي طالب؛ أصبحت مولاي و مولى كل مسلم. فأنزل الله عزّ و جلّ: (اليوم أكملت لكم دينكم)؛ [16]

On the day of Ghadir Khum, when the Prophet, peace and blessings of God be upon him, took the hand of 'Ali bin Abi Talib, he said: Am I not the guardian of the believers? They said: Yes, O Messenger of God. He said: Whoever I am his master, 'Ali is his master. So O'Umar bin Khatab said: Blessed be to you son of Abi Talib! You became my master and every Muslim. Then God sent down this verse: اليوم أكملت لكم دينكم.

Naturally, the phrase "you have become my master" is not

compatible with the meaning of "friend and helper" for the word "master" (مولا); Because it indicates the realization of a new thing, and 'Umar certainly does not want to say that Amir al-Mu'minin 'Ali, peace be upon him, was not his friend and helper, but after the speech of the Holy Prophet, peace be upon him, they became friends.

What happened and was expressed in Ghadir Khum has many precedents, clues and evidences that prevent false interpretation and distortion of the truth. These cases have been described in detail in many books and articles, and their detailed retelling is not included in this article. But it is worth reminding that if it is claimed that the speech of the Messenger of God in Ghadir was only due to the complaint of a few people, the claimant must answer questions far beyond what have been asked before.

A strange distortion in the Saudi brochure

All the criticisms that we raised about Ibn Kathir, also apply to the author of the Saudi pamphlet; because he also narrated the story of Ibn Kathir; But a strange issue has been raised in this brochure - beyond the words of Ibn Kathir:

Ali (ra) appointed a successor for himself and went early to reach the Hajj (farewell) ceremony. Ali's successor (RA) gave each of his companions a linen dress and allowed them to ride on the camels that were captured. After completing the Hajj, 'Ali (RA) returned to them and took the clothes and camels from the people...

It can be seen that he considered the return of Amir al-Mu'minin, peace be upon him, to the companions of Yemen after the completion of Hajj rituals; However, Ibn Kathir is silent about this and by

omitting phrases in the quote from Ibn Ishaq, he has left the time ambiguous so that it can be assumed that the time of the complaints was after the Hajj rituals.

But there is an even more unusual story that is not found in any documents and is the invention of the author: "Ghadir Khum, which was 160 kilometers from Mecca, was the meeting place of the army returning from Yemen - who were complaining and protesting against 'Ali (RA) - and the pilgrims returning from Mecca".

This invention is, of course, to tie the complaints of the Yemeni companions better to Ghadir's speech, and the truth of Ghadir's message can be concealed more easily. But the chosen way is very clumsy and unscientific beyond imagination.

End notes:

[2]. The text of this brochure, whose name "Ishaq Debiri" is

mentioned as its author, is also available on the Wahabian website with the same title. [3]. Amir al-Mu'minin, peace be upon him, had several trips to Yemen, which have been mixed up in this text (for more information on this, see: Hosseini Qazvini, Hadith Al-Ghadir, and the doubt of Jaish Al-Iman). According to the aforementioned research, the Holy Prophet has traveled to Yemen three times: the first trip to preach and invite, the second trip to judge and the third trip to collect alms, the last trip was shortly before Hajj al-Wada. In the text of the mentioned brochure, the events of the first and last turn have been confused and this confusion has become the subject of abuse, which we will mention in the rest of the article.

[7]. In the same article, it was mentioned that this trip was for the invitation to Islam and it also led to conflicts. In this mission, the Hamadan tribe converted to Islam. For further reading, refer to: Hosseini Qazvini,

Hadith Al-Ghadir, and the doubt of Jaish El-Iman.

[8]. See: Hosseini Qazvini, *ibid.*

[9]. Ahmad bin Hanbal, *Musnad*, 5/356

[10]. Nasa'i, *Sunan*, 5/130; *Homo*, characteristics, 94.

[11]. Ibn Abi Shaiba, author, 7/504.

[12] Hakim Nishaburi, *al-Mustadrak*, 3/110.

[13]. Ibn Kathir, *al-Badaiya wa al-Nahaiya*, 5/228.

[14]. The same, 5/229.

[15]. the same

[16]. Ibn Kathir, *al-Badaiya wa al-Nahaiya*, 7/383.

List of sources:

Ibn Abi Shaybah al-Kufi, Abu Bakr Abdullah bin Muhammad,

compiler of Ibn Abi Shaybah (Classified in Hadiths and Antiquities), Beirut, Dar Al-Fikr for printing, publishing and distribution, 1409 BC.

Ibn Hanbal, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad, Musnad, Beirut, Dar Sader, Book Ta.

Ibn Kathir, Ismail, al-Badaiya wa al-Nahaiya, Beirut, Dar Ahya al-Rath al-Arabi, 1408 AH.

Ibn Hisham, Abdul Malik, Al-Sirah al-Nabawiyah, Egypt, School of Muhammad Ali Sabih, 1383 AH.

Razi, Abul Fattouh, Ruz al-Jinnan and Ruh al-Jinan in Tafsir al-Qur'an, Mashhad, Islamic Research Foundation of Astan Quds Razavi, peace be upon him, 1408 AH.

Hosseini Qazvini, Seyyed Muhammad, Hadith al-Ghadir and the suspicion of Jaish al-Aliman, Qom, Wali al-Asr Foundation for Islamic Studies, 1428 AH.

Shoushtari, Qazi Nurullah, Majlis al-Mu'minin, Manuscript of the Islamic Council. Tarihi, Fakhreddin, Majma Al-Bahrin, Islamic Culture Publishing House, 1408 AH.

Neishabouri, Mohammad bin Abdullah, Al-Mustadrak Ali Al-Sahihin, Beirut, Daral-e-Marefa, N.D.

Javad Alaa Al-Muhaddestin (Doctor of Quran and Hadith Sciences and Director of Cultural Research, Tehran Azad University)

¹ Ibn Hisham, 4:1021,1022

² Al-Badayah va Al-Nahayah, 5/227

³ Ibid, 5/228

⁴ For more details refer to Hadith al-Gadir va Shubhe Shekva Jaish al-Yaman, Dr. Seyyid Muhammad Husseini Qazvini, Iel-Derasat al-Islamiyah, Qum, 1428 A.H.

⁵ ibid

⁶ Musnad Ahmad, 5:356

⁷ Sunan Nisa'ei 5:130/ Khasa'is Nisa'ei, 94

⁸ Musnaf ibn Abi Sheibah, 7:504

⁹ Mustadrak Hakim, 3:110

¹⁰ Al-Badayah va Al-Nahayah

¹¹ Ibid, 5:229