The Essence of Logic;

Logic and Vahi Discrepancy

Reza Berenjkar

Professor of Tehran University

Article acceptance date: February. 2016

Abstract: logic in the word of Arab means prevention. Logic is the foundation of a kind of gnosis which leads human beings to the right path. Though it should be noticed that logic is not an innate soul-bound trait, it is a blessing from God which lightens up human beings' soul. On the other hand, the perceptions of logic is clear and unerring and are trustable in their essence. While the logic which is dealt with in Philosophy is erring and a stage of mind's understanding. The discrepancy between logic and words have various forms and it is impossible to give them the same judgment.

Key Word: *Vahi(revelation of God to His Prophets)*

Introduction:

Clarifying the meaning of logic and its borders are of the most significant and basic discussions. This clarification can introduce logical solutions to many religious based disputes such as conflict between logic and Vahi (Revelation from God.)

All are able to talk about logic, make examples, and give some definitions though their definitions and examples can be vague or general.

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]

Generally, when logic is the subject of discussions, we can hear these words: Godly logic, humanly logic, partly logic, general logic, reasoning logic, witnessing logic, shallow logic, realistic logic, theoretical logic, practical logic, non-experimental logic, non-revelational logic,… .

Therefore, before opening any discussion, which includes the discussion on the relationship between logic and Vahi, the exact meaning and its borders should be clarified. The present article aimed at clarifying the meaning of logic. It tries to investigate some points like the relationship between soul and logic, the time of benefiting from logic and its perfection, the grades of logic, logic trustability, the relationship between will and logic, the realm of logical judgment to clear up the meaning of logic. Then it encompasses the conflict between logic and Vahi.

Logic in Arabic language

The meaning of logic in Arabic is prohibition, forbiddance and stoppage.[1] The usages of logic are derived from these meanings. Khalil Nahwi said, logic is the opposite of ignorance.[2] Raqib argued that logic is the ready potentiality to accept knowledge.[3] Ibn Faras said logic is named logic as it prohibits us from evil deeds and talks.[4] Jurjani said, logic stops men from distractions from right path.[5]

The conclusion of this part is the meaning of logic which is prevention and in this meaning two sides have been regarded: a recognition-base side and a value-based side. It means logic is the root of recognition. A kind of recognition which leads human beings to right path and good deeds.

To end up in right path it is essential to realize true beliefs which are in accordance with reality. To recognize good deeds it is obligatory to know what is good and what is bad. Therefore, it can be said logic is something which shows true beliefs and good deeds to human beings.

The mentioned literal meaning of this word has been used in Quran and traditions. In this case similar to other cases nothing is added to this meaning to change it, of course there are some interpretations regarding it which added some descriptions and conditions to it which is called “Ta’addud Dal and Madlul”.

Here, first we present several examples from Islamic resources about the literal meaning of logic. Then we will embark on the specific features added to it.

a. Examples on the literal meaning of logic

1. In the realm of religion

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]

There are various verses in Quran which command people to think logically about the verses concerning creations[6]; and the reasons of disbelief and distortions have been called lack of logical thinking.[7]

In traditions, growth and guidance have been named as the results of logic.[8] In a tradition from the holy Prophet we read,[9]

ان العقل عقال من الجهل

From Ali (a.s.), it has been narrated that,[10]

العقل اصل العلم

"Logic is the base of knowledge."

Imam Sadiq said in this regard, wisdom, understanding, and knowledge are resulted from logic.[11]

It has been narrated from imam Sadiq that human beings can realize being creatures and having a Creator Who plans for them through their logic.[12] In traditions sometimes logic has been lined up against ignorance and sometimes knowledge has been mentioned to be against ignorance.[13] The commonality between these two traditions is logic which is the root of knowledge. Therefore in this sense ignorance can be regarded as the opposite of logic. Also in this confrontation ignorance does not mean lack of any science but lack of true knowledge which leads human beings to the path of God. In this regard, anyone who has not such a knowledge, although is equipped with other knowledge is ignorant. Therefore ignorance has two meanings: one is the lack of any knowledge, second lack of useful knowledge.

Apparently, the expressions like knowledge ('ilm), hikmah, ma'rifah (gnosis), and God's acceptance which are the results of logic show the gnosis which is in accordance with reality. From this we can conclude that logic can show honesty and dishonesty so it is a reason from God.[14] In the well-known tradition of Mi'raj it has been asserted that the one who does not use his logic will err.[15]

2. In the realm of practice and ethics

In holy Quran we read,

وَيَجْعَلُ الرِّجْسَ عَلَى الَّذِينَ لاَ يَعْقِلُونَ

"and he casts uncleanness on those who will not understand"(10:100)

In various traditions good deeds and morality, e.g. good deeds[16], not committing sins[17], worshipping God[18], patience and humbleness[19], politeness and good manner[20], piety,[21] justice and avoiding bad temper,[22] good speaking,[23]putting everything in its suitable place[24] have been counted as the results of logic.

In a famous tradition, it has been said that when imam Sadiq was defining the word logic as something which causes God's

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]

worship and heaven be gained. Someone asked, so what's it called which is in Mu'awiyah? Imam answered, that is mischief which looks like logic but it is not logic. It means logic guides to goodness, benevolence and truth not aberration[25].

The mentioned evidences assert that good deeds are the result of logic. In some traditions we read that human beings can recognize good and bad through logic.[26] The one who uses logic will not revolt against truth and logic will not embellish badness as goodness.[27] In a part about the relationship between logic and soul some other evidence from Quran and Sunnah will be mentioned.

As we have seen in some cases "*recognizing*" good and bad are counted as results of logic and in other cases *"good deeds"* are mentioned as its result. It can be said that logic not only is the criterion to distinguish bad from good but also shows the necessity of such an action. Therefore, to think logically, i.e. to listen to the message of logic, human beings should be able to do good deeds.

In brief, logic in its literal meaning and also in Quran and Sunnah is a light in the realm of theory and practice which helps people get a recognition based on truth. In practical realm it shows good deeds. Therefore the possibility of making mistake will be zero. Though it is possible that logic can not understand something, i.e. that issue be above its understanding level, in its realm it will make no mistake. In a research we have done we did not find any example of logic which made a mistake. In the following, other proof on our claim which is unerring essence of logic have been presented.

b. Other features of logic

Various features have been cited regarding logic that here we only suffice to the basic features:

1. The relationship between logic and soul (an analysis on the recognition essence of logic)

Islamic resources did not talk directly about this issue much. But regarding the verses and traditions, it seems that logic in contrast to what is common in philosophy is not a non seperatable phenomenon from soul, it is not mentioned in the definition of the soul, but logic is a gift of God, a light bestowed to human beings by God to lighten their souls which helps human beings to distinguish right and wrong.

Here we are going to mention those traditions which assert this. In some of these traditions some other characteristics have been mentioned for logic.

1.1. Logic is similar to light which lighten up soul. Imam Musa Kazim said,

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]

ان ضوئ الروح، العقل[28]

i.e. truly, logic is the light of soul.

In a tradition from the Prophet mentioned in Shia and Sunnite books,

العقل نور فی القلب یفرق به بین الحق و الباطل[۲۹]

i.e. logic is a ray of light in heart by which right and wrong can be distinguished. (some times instead of the word soul the word heart has been used.)

In another tradition we read, when a human being grows up to be a man or woman, in his heart a ray of light will appear. Since then, Vajib and Mustahab (religiously obligatory actions and religiously advised actions) , good and bad are all understandable to him. Logic in heart is like a light hung in a home.[30]

1.2. Some traditions are speaking about the creation of logic.[31]

1.3. Imam Baqir said, the resident of logic is soul and heart.[32]

1.4. Imam ‘Ali said, Gabriel came to Adam and said, oh Adam! I was ordered to suggest three things to you to choose one of them and leave the other two. Adam asked, what are they? He said, logic, Haya (modesty), and religion. Adam said, I choose logic. Gabriel said to Haya and religion, go back! They said, we are ordered to accompany logic wherever it is![33]

1.5. In another tradition it has been said about the creation of those human beings who do not have logic and mind are not responsible.[34]

1.6. The holy Quran said,

وَنَفْسٍ وَمَا سَوَّاهَا فَأَلْهَمَهَا فُجُورَهَا وَتَقْوَاهَا قَدْ أَفْلَحَ مَنْ زَكَّاهَا وَقَدْ خَابَ مَنْ دَسَّاهَا

“By the soul and who shaped it, and inspired it with its sin and its piety, prosperous is he who purified it, and failed is he who buried it!”(91:7-10)

According to these verses God after the creation of human being inspired piety to him.

Imam Sadiq interpreted the word فجور and تقوا (Fujur and Taqwa) like this: God inspired human being whatever he should do and whatever he shouldn’t, He taught him rightness and falsehood.[35]

As the same thing has been said about logic it is assumed that this inspiration is that inspiration of the light of logic to the soul.[36]

2. The time of benefiting from logic and its perfection

As we have seen in the holy verse, human beings after completion, is equipped with logic. In fiqh, this level is called the age of understanding, which means in this age distinguishing right and wrong is possible. But it is different among human beings. Usually it is about 12 years old. In a tradition about the verse

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]

وَلَمَّا بَلَغَ أَشُدَّهُ وَاسْتَوَى آتَيْنَاهُ حُكْمًا وَعِلْمًا وَكَذَلِكَ نَجْزِي الْمُحْسِنِين

and when he was full grown, and reached the perfection of his strength, we gave him judgment and knowledge. as such we recompense the gooddoers. (28:14)

We read,

اشده

means 18 years old and استوی means the time of growing bear and mustache.[37]

Also in other traditions we read about perfection of logic by the age of 28,35,56.

3. The levels of logic

The degree of having logic in human beings is various. In traditions of Sunnite and Shia the highness of human beings is according to the level of their logic.[38]In addition to that, the duty of each person and its accountability in Hereafter would be based on the level of his logic. [39]In a tradition we read, the holy Prophet enjoys 99 parts of logic and a part of them has been scattered among all other human beings.[40]

4. logic as a clear proof (Hujjat)

Hujjat means a clear proof; in a way that there remains no place for excuse. God has two kinds of proof: the first is apparent,i.e. infallibles and imams; the second, the inside proof, i.e. logic.[41]

The significant point is logic which is an inside proof and can lead people to God and religion. The base of each holy religion is to prove the unity of God and prophethood, these two are proved by logic. On the other hand, when we realize religion as a proof, logic will prove the necessity of following God and His messenger.[42] As we have seen, a condition of being responsible is to enjoy logic. "*Logic*" being as a proof and its fundamental role in knowing the other proof assert logic as a phenomenon which makes no mistakes.

5. the relationship between will and logic

From what we have read so far we can infer that logic is given by God and people are benefiting from it in different levels. In various traditions we read that logic is a gift from God[43] and it is the highest gift.[44]

Here we have this question in front of us can human being's will power determine the level of logic he enjoys? The answer is yes. First, logic is something which is donated to us by God but using it or not is in our control, based on our will.

Second, human being's will power is effective in strengthening the logic or weakening it.

Regarding the first one, we can say, human being has logic and lust both. He can will which one to follow.[45] If he

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]

follows his logic it will benefit him but if he follows his lust it will destroy him. Due to this, the verses of holy Quran blame unbelievers why they don't think.

About the second issue it should be said in some traditions logic has been divided into two parts: one which is our logic which is given by God and the second empirical logic which is governed by the will power.[46]

In addition in some other traditions it is talked about teaching logic and acquiring logic.[47] In Islamic texts, it is said some actions like learning, politeness and following rightness[48] can increase logic. In contrast some actions can deteriorate logic: lust[49], arrogance[50], greediness[51], interacting ignorant ones[52], drinking wine[53]

In brief, logic in the book of God and the words of infallibles is not a sense which errs; it is a light from God which lighten up soul and heart. By its help differing right from wrong is possible. Therefore, logic is an inside proof, the base of outside proof. This logic is called Fitrah logic ,'Aql Salim or heavenly logic.

[1] Refer to Juhari, *al-Sihah*, vol.5,p.1769; Fiyyuti, *al-Misbah al-Munir*, p.422-423; ibn Faras, *Mu'jam Maqaiis al-Lughah*, vol.4,p.69

[2] *Mu'jam Maqaiis al-Lughah*, vol.4, p.69

[3] Raqib Isfahani, *Mufradat al-Faz al-Quran*, p.577

[4] *Mu'jam Maqaiis al-Lughah*, vol.4, p.69

[5] Jurjani, *al-Ta'rifat*,p.65

[6] Refer to: Ale 'Imran, 118; Muminun, 80; Nur, 61; Hadid, 17; Baqarah, 164; Ra'd,4; Naml, 12; Rum, 24,28,…

[7] Refer to: Anbiya, 67; Baqarah, 170, 171; Ma'idah 58; Anfal, 22; Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*, p.44; *Kanzul Fawaid*, vol.2, p.31; *al-Firdus*, vol.2; p.150, vol.3, p.217

[8] *Nahj al-Balāghah*, Hikmat 421; Guralul Hikam, no. 7078; *kanzul Fawaid*, vol.2,p.31.

[9] Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*, p.15

[10] *Ghurarul Hikam*,no.1959,816

[11] *Kafi*, vol.1, p.25; *'ilal al-Sharaye*,p.103

[12] *Kafi*, vol.1,p.29

[13] Refer to: *Kafi*, vol.1, p.14,21; *Tanbih al-Khavatir,* vol.2,p.14;*Ghurarul Hikam*, tradition. 1736

[14] *Kafi*,vol.1,p.25

[15] *Irshad al-Qulub*,p.205

[16] *Khisal*,vol.2, p.633, hadith arb'a ma'e

[17] *Kafi*,vol.1,p.18; *Ghurarul Hikam*, tradition, 6393,1737, 7340

[18] *Kafi*, vol.1, p.11

[19] Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*,p.28

[20] *Irshad al-Qulub*, vol.1,p.199;*Ghurarul Hikam*,no.1280

[21] *Kafi*, vol.8,p.241

[22] I'lam al-Din,p.127

[23] Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*,p.323;*Ghurarul Hikam*, no.9416,7091,4776,10961

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]

[24]*Nahj al-Balāghah*, hikmah 235; *Kanzul Fawaid*,vol.1,p.200

[25]*Kafi*,vol.1,pp.3,11.

[26]*Kafi*, vol.1,p.29

[27] Refer to: *Irshad al-Qulub*, vol.1, p.205

[28] Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*,p.396

[29]*Irshad al-Qulub*,vol.1,p.198; *Rabi al-Abrar*, vol.3,p.137.also refer to *Avali al-Laali*,vol.1,pp.248,244

[30] I'lal al-Sharaye,p.98

[31] Refer to: *Kafi*,vol.1,p.10,21,26,28; *Khisal*, vol.2,p.427; *Ma'ani al-Akhbar*, p.313; *Rudha al-Waezin*,p.7; *al-Ikhtisas*,p.244; *Avameli al-laali,*vol.1,p.248;al-*faqih*,vol.4,p.267; *al-Mahasin*,p.192; *Hilyat al-Uliya*,vol.7,p.318; *Tarikh Baghdad*,vol.13,p.40

[32]*Ilal al-Sharaye*,p.107

[33]*Kafi*, vol.1,p.10; *Irshad al-Qulub*,p.198

[34]*Bihar al-Anwār*,vol.93,p.41

[35]*Kafi*, vol.1,p.163; *Tafsiral-Qumi*, vol.2,p.424; *Bihar al-Anwār* vol.24,p.72

[36] Refer to *Tuḥid al-Imamiyah* for more explanation.

[37]*Tuḥid al-Imamiyah*,p.23

[38]*Kafi*.7055*; Rabi al Abrar*,vol.3,p.137;*Hilyat al-Uliya*vol.1,p.362;*Tarikh Baghdad*,vol.8,p.360

[39]Al-Mahasin,vol.1,pp.308,608; *Kafi*,vol.1,pp.11,12,26; *Ma'anial-Akhbar*,vol.1,p.2; *Irshad al-Qulub*vol.1,p.199; *al-Ja'fariyat*, p.148

[40]*Bihar al-Anwār*, vol.1,p.97

[41]*Kafi*, vol.1,pp.16,13,25; Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*,pp.285,283,331

[42]*Kafi*, vol.1,p.29

[43]*Kafi*,vol.1,p.23; Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul* p.330; kanzul Fawaid,vol.1,p.56; *irshad*, vol.1,p.198;*jame al ahadith*,p.101; Ghural, no.227,3545; *she'b al iman*,vol.5,pp.388,7040; *al-Firdus*, vol.3,pp.155,4419.

[44]*Kafi*,vol.1,p.12;*irshad*,vol.1,pp.99; arāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*, p.293; *kanzul Fawaid*,no.7053

[45]*Bihar al-Anwār*, vol.60,p.299

[46]*Mataalib al-Seul*,p.49; *Mufradat*,p.577

[47]*Tarikh Yaqubi*,vol.2,p.98; *al-Firdus*,vol.5,p.325

[48]Ḥarāni, *Tuḥaf al-'Ughul*, p.364; *Kafi*,vol.1,p.20; *I'lam al Din*,p.298

[49]*Nahj al-Balāghah*,letter 3

[50]*Nahj al-Balāghah*, Hikmat, 212

[51]*Nahj al-Balāghah* Hikmat

[Downloaded from safinah-al-nejat.ir on 2026-11-23]