

Hikmah

Reason And Reason Gnosis From Imam ‘Ali View Point

Riza Berenjkar
Islamic researcher

Article acceptance date: January ۲۰۱۶

Abstract: from Imam ‘Ali view point, logic is something which is endowed by God and it is a criterion to differ human beings from animals. Human beings enjoy will power and free will in both aspects, regarding animal aspects of his body (worldly desires; i.e. sex) and also angel-wise aspect (i.e. wisdom and reason). He can choose to be superior to angels or to be inferior to animals.

What stands against reason is ignorance which surrounds lust and sinful passions. Ahkām, reason and lust can not line up in a same direction. Some people like Hume says logic is at the same length of lust and in fact at its service. But in the opinion of imam ‘Ali, mankind’s prosperity is in the following of logic, and mankind’s misery is in following his lust.

Reason is an understanding power and forbidding or encouraging force. Reason and ethics have a deep relationship. Morality strengthen reason and immorality weakens it.

The relationship between reason and religion is similar to the relationship between reason and morality. Reason will lead mankind to religion and Ahkam are regarded as a part of that religion. Religion also is influential in logical growth of human being.

Reason and science has a mutual relationship. Reason is the leader of senses and the most important starting point in knowing human beings. Science is helpful in increasing reason. Free will of human being and ageing are both effective in empowering logic.

Keywords: religion, reason, Hikmah

Introduction

The history of reasoning and logic is as old as the age of humanity in the world. The separating criterion among human beings and other creatures is his ability to think. Human beings can continue his existence in the world by the power of thinking. According to Imam ‘Ali,

الانسان بعقله

Human being is human due to enjoying logic and reason.’

And also said,

اصل الانسان لبه

The base of mankind is his wisdom.’

Usually, in the philosophy books, it is said that reasoning started appearing in Anatolia’s seaside and in a region named Ionia by appearing Thales and

Anaximander; before that people were living at the time of imagination and myth. These words- which are not true- is only applicable to the start of a special kind of thinking not general reasoning and thinking. Of course, paying attention to philosophical reasoning and thinking, and in another word, reasoning in the domain of philosophical reasoning and reviewing it is something, which belongs to recent years. This phenomenon according to remained written documents was suggested in the time of Sophism and Socrates in part. After that, in modern era, by Francis Bacon, René Descartes, and John Locke this issue of knowledge and specially reasoning and logic was brought into spotlight, and in the works of Immanuel Kant reaches its height; it becomes equal with philosophy and

eventually it resulted in modern Epistemology.

By a glance at the suggested discussions in the history of thought and philosophy, we face different opinions of Plato with Aristotle, Mutakallim with Mystics, Descartes with Kant, and so on; because everyone meant something different. The perplexity raises where we find out human beings have different interpretations of what is the base of their being human. In this way the importance of studying the issue of logic and reasoning from the view point of Imam ‘Ali becomes clear; as God, the Almighty, by his great bounty, endowed him the best and highest grade of logic. Therefore, he can be the best interpreter and explainer of reasoning.

Reasoning

In word and expression

Reason and logic literally means prohibition, forbearance, and stoppage. Other meanings of reason are derived from this meaning and are suitable with them. For example, the tool which ties a camel with it is called ‘Iqal, because it stops a camel from movement. Logic of mankind is called logic because it stops him from doing or saying bad deeds or words. Khalīl Nahvī said, reason and logic are violators of ignorance.⁷

Ibn Faras also said the reason of giving this name to logic is as it prohibits human being from saying or doing wrong things.⁸ Jurjānī also believed logic prohibits its holder to go stray.⁹

As we see philologists, not only do explain the literal meaning of reason which is prohibition but also refer to other aspects or applications of it, i.e. two gnostic and value-oriented of reason. As we will see these two aspects of reason have been mentioned in the words of Imam ‘Ali.

One of the equivalents for logic and reason is (نهی) nuhyah which in Quran has been used in plural form as (نهی) Nuha (logics, wisdoms).¹ As far as reason prohibits from bad deeds, it is called Nuha Aql (forbidding reasoning).²

Concerning the expressional meaning of ‘Aql, we should say, in the history of west and east philosophy of thought, different interpretations of ‘Aql has been given.³ For example, ‘Aql or Nous to Anaxagoras is as an ordering force, which moved and separated out the original mixture, which was homogeneous, or nearly so. ‘Aql for Plato is a tool which based on dialectic elevates mankind to the world of مثل (Muthul).

Regarding all these things and regardless of all detailed interpretations, we can say in philosophy and Kilam, there are two

general expressions for reason: in one of them logic and reason are something which are basically and practically independent, which means unrelated to soul and body. A lot of philosophers due to the rule of الواحد لا يصدر منه الا الواحد and the rule امکان اشرف and other reasons pictured a series of 'Uqul which are causes of receiving God's blessings; from God only one creature which is called first logic will be issued and from that the second logic and from that the third logic until the tenth logic which is called active logic. Nature is issued from this logic. These logics are stood up in vertical line and among them the cause and effect relationship exists. Shaykh Ishraq after proving vertical logics of Mashayeen, regarded that the number is more than ten and besides vertical logics, he believed in latitudinal logics or (ارباب انواع) Arbab Anwa'.^٩ Sadrudin Shirazi also confirmed this concept and interpreted it in a special way.^{١٠}

In other expression, reason is one of the powers of carnal desires. In this meaning, logic is in unity with nafs (self), is one of its powers, and is against imagination and senses. 'Aql is able to understand general things and can infer theoretical issues from given preliminaries. This 'Aql is classified into two groups based on its understanding: theoretical 'Aql and practical 'Aql.

Some classified human beings reason into Ratio or intellectus reason. Ratio is what infers theories from given information; but intellectus is what witnesses truth.

A lot of philosophers, about the relationship between humanistic logic and independent logic believe that generalities of logic is located in active 'Aql and it is this 'Aql which gives these generalities to humanistic logics.

The place of 'Aql in the nature of human beings

One of the discussions which declares the importance of logic is the place of logic in human beings. As we will see, from the view point of imam 'Ali, 'Aql is the most important blessing of God endowed to human beings by God and this blessing is what differs human beings from animals.

Lub (لب) which is the synonym of 'Aql and in Quran is used in plural as اولوالالباب. (the owner of wisdoms)) Lub in word means origin of something as walnut which is called لب الجوز. 'Aql is the origin of human beings and humanity of a person depends on his reason.

In the introduction of this article, we read that Imam 'Ali knew humanity of a person to his 'Aql. In another tradition, the difference among mankind, animal, and angel is explained like this,

God endowed angels with a logic without carnal desires, in animals carnal desires without logic, so anyone whose logic is over his carnal desires is superior than angels and any one whose carnal desires overcome his logic is inferior than animals.^{۱۳}

According to this, the difference between human being and animal is his logic and the difference between him and angels his carnal desires. And the difference between him and both of them is the combination between 'Aql and carnal desires and their outcomes. In the opposite of animals, there is only one way and that is carnal desire. And in front of angel there is only one way which is logic. But human beings enjoys both, two contrary forces, each one opens a special path in front of mankind and invites him to something. This is when choosing becomes important. 'Aql or carnal desires. When free choice comes to the scene, responsibility comes into existence.

Imam Ali after mentioning the difference among human beings and angels and animals pointed out to two things: one which says human being is superior to animals if his logic overcomes lust. And the second he is inferior than animals if his carnal desires overcome his logic.

The reason of the first point is as angels only have logics and they have no other way in front. Therefore, following logic is

not a difficult work for them. But in human beings there is also lust and lust invites human beings to the opposite path. To follow his logic he should calm down his lust which is a very difficult thing to do. Due to this, the value of one who follows his logic against his lust is more than one who follows his logic as his only choice. Of course the value of anyone who chooses carnal desires over his logic is lower than anyone who doesn't know any other way than this.

If we want to give a definition about human being, we can define human being as a being who has 'Aql and carnal desires. But as it has been said, the necessity of these two forces, is free will. Human beings due to this latter force, freely can choose 'Aql or lust. Therefore, free will is at the next step of these two forces not at the same horizontal line. When it puts into practice, it can be divided into logical will and lust-bound will.

Meanwhile, what clarifies the value of a human being and puts him in a position superior than angels is his logical free will. And what brings him perversion and makes him inferior than animals is his lust-bound free will. Due to this imam 'Ali said in the importance of logic,

قيمه كل امرء عقله

The value of each person is his logic.^{۱۴}

اغنى الغنى العقل

The highest needlessness is wisdom.^{١٥}

‘Aql against carnal desires and ignorance (Jahl)

As we have said imam puts ‘Aql against carnal desires and knew human beings a creature made up of them both. He spoke about this opposition in the other way, among them the followings:

- Whenever ‘Aql is perfect, carnal desires will become less.^{١٦}
- Whoever enjoys a perfect logic will belittle carnal desires.^{١٧}
- Anyone who overcomes his carnal desires, his logic will become clear.^{١٨}
- The companion of lust has sick soul and unsound mind.^{١٩}

And in another wise saying,

‘Aql and lust are in the opposite. Knowledge is confirmer of ‘Aql and carnal desire is the embellishment of lust. Nafs (نفس) is wandering between them; each one overcomes the other, nafs will go to his side.^{٢٠}

In this tradition, carnal desires are embellishing lust. In some sayings quoted from him ‘Aql is standing against carnal desires. For example, in the followings:

- Calamity of ‘Aql is carnal desires.^{٢١}
- Carnal desires are calamity of wisdom.^{٢٢}

• Following carnal desires will contaminate ‘Aql.^{٢٣}

• Carnal desires is the opponent of ‘Aql.^{٢٤}

• Nothing is as enemy as carnal desires to ‘Aql.^{٢٥}

• ‘Aql is the owner and the commander of the army of blessing and carnal desire is the commander of Satan Army. And each one of them wants to attract nafs to itself. Each one can win, nafs will be in his control.^{٢٦}

From comparing these traditions with each other, we realize that lust and carnal desires are an element or two very close to each other.

In some traditions, ignorance (Jahl) stood up against ‘Aql. Even some great traditionalists like Kulayni titled a chapter of his book as “ ‘Aql and Jahl”, not for example “ knowledge (‘Ilm) and Jahl”, of course, in traditions, we sometimes confront the opposition of ‘Ilm and Jahl; for example, imam ‘Ali said, ignorance of a wealthy person will humiliate him and knowledge of poor person will elevate him.^{٢٧} But usually ‘Aql is opposite of jahl. As he said,

• No needless ness is similar to Aql and no poverty is similar to jahl.^{٢٨}

• ‘Aql will rescue and guide but jahl will mislead and destroy.^{٢٩}

•Wise person depends on his ‘Aql and ignorant person on his wish and dreams.”

From these traditions, related to ‘Aql and jahl and their outcomes, it is understood that these two are exactly against each other or even two opposite forces in human beings. But confrontation of ‘Aql with lust shows that jahl in these traditions means lust as well.

It seems that in the sayings of ‘Ali and other infallibles jahl has no common meaning. Sometimes it means ignorance and lack of knowledge so it stands opposite of ‘ilm. But sometimes jahl means lust. In this meaning it is against ‘Aql, and these two, i.e. ‘Aql and Jahl are two opposite forces which human being is always witnessing their conflict.

It is worth saying that in a famous tradition “جنود عقل و جهل” (the army of ‘Aql and jahl) from imam Sadiq it is narrated that ‘ilm is from the army of ‘Aql and jahl is from the army of jahl and these two are against each other. Likewise, their commanders (‘Aql and jahl) are standing against each other.” It is obvious that the meaning of Jahl as a commander of that army is different from jahl which is a soldier: jahl as a commander is that same lust force which stands up against aql and naturally has lot of soldiers.

Among outcomes of ‘Aql and its army is ‘ilm; because the prerequisite of following ‘Aql is acquiring knowledge. On the other

hand, jahl which means ignorance and lack of knowledge, is from the army of jahl force and lust force; because the necessity of jahl and lust is quitting knowledge.

These two meanings of jahl are rooted in Arab language. Ibn Faris said,

Jahl has two origins and two original meanings: one of them is lack of ‘ilm and the other one a sense which is interpreted as feebleness and is against peacefulness and equilibrium.

Izutsu, the famous linguist and a scholar of Islam, after studying the poems belonged to the ignorance era before advent of Islam and also studying about Quran, introduced three meanings for jahl: the first meaning of jahl is a kind of brevity which causes losing your control, so without thinking you may do something which is harmful at the end.

The result of the first meaning of Jahl leads to its second meaning which is feebleness and uselessness. The third meaning of jahl is lack of ‘ilm.”

Which rationality?

As we have studied, from imam ‘Ali’s point of view, ‘Aql is against lust and carnal desires, principles and prerequisites of these two are against each other. And human being enjoys both of them and by his free will can choose one over the other one.

In another interpretation from 'Aql, 'Aql is not in line with lust but it is in the same vertical order and at the service of it. This interpretation is the interpretation of David Hume from 'Aql. This idea has impact on lots of western philosophical and ethical schools.

Hume denies the noetic application of 'Aql. He also deletes the ethical and practical application of 'Aql, it means good, bad, does and dents and setting the goals of life. He said these are not the duties of 'Aql. He emphasized on the sense-bound experiences of 'Aql instead of its noetic role and instead of its practical role, he pointed to feelings like lust, carnal desires, love, and anger.^{٢٧} In this way, 'Aql has not the ability to find out truth in theoretical aspect or the ability to realize good from bad or setting the goals of ethical life in practical sense.

In this way the very lust that imam 'Ali knew to be against 'Aql, so he humiliated it, is recognized by Hume as a power to set goals and good or bad. then 'Aql is demoted and became at the service of lust. While from the point of view of Imam, salvation of human being is in following those goals which are set by 'Aql and misfortune is in the following of lust and carnal desires.

In a tradition from imam 'Ali, we read,

Get advice from 'Aql and oppose your carnal desires to find victory and salvation.^{٢٨}

Also he said,

A wise person is the enemy of his pleasure (lustfulness) and ignorant person servant of his lust.^{٢٩}

But according to Hume, basically 'Aql does not have the role of setting goals and differing bad from good, and only feelings and carnal desires can set the goals of life. Accordingly, human beings has no way unless following lust and his will is the outcome of feeling pleasure or pain. According to Hume, an action, feeling or behavior is praiseworthy or blameworthy which its visiting can make pleasure or sadness.^{٣٠} Therefore, pleasure equals good and pain equals bad.^{٣١}

Hume after denying theatrical and practical usages of 'Aql and putting experiences and feelings instead of it, offered another role for it:

"Reason is, and ought only to be the slave of the passions, and can never pretend to any other office than to serve and obey them."^{٣٢} In other words, in his opinion, Aql is only a tool to enjoy. So it helps mankind to reach pleasure or meet his carnal desires.

His interpretation from 'Aql is 'Aql as a tool. In the part about usages of 'Aql, we will see imam 'Ali accepts this meaning

for ‘Aql but his interpretation is completely different from Hume’s.

Meanings and ‘Aql’s applications

In the introduction and also in the discussion about literal and expressional meaning of ‘Aql, we said there are different interpretations for ‘Aql. Some of these interpretations specify a special application for ‘Aql and deny other applications. Hume’s opinion which was explained before is a good example. Now we are going to review different applications which are said by imam ‘Ali in this regard.

١. Theoretical applications of ‘Aql

Regarding the theoretical applications of rationality, we can refer to two types of imam ‘Ali’s traditions: a part of them specifically and merely recognize ‘ilm, knowledge and hikmah to be the results of ‘Aql and reason. These traditions can include ‘ilm and theoretical hikmah as well. But a part of these traditions recognize self-recognition, knowing God, and knowing religion as the results of ‘Aql. These traditions declare the theoretical applications of ‘Aql. Here, we cite several traditions from both groups:

- ‘Aql is the base and origin of ‘ilm and inviter to understanding.^{٢٩}
- Whoever thinks will find knowledge.^{٣٠}
- With ‘Aql depth of hikmah can be reached.^{٣١}

• The highest ‘Aql is knowing ourself.^{٣٢}

• The highest ‘Aql is recognizing haq (truth) with haq.^{٣٣}

• With ‘Aqls knowing God will be stable.^{٣٤}

• God clears Himself to wisdom through its signs of true prudence.^{٣٥}

• A faithful person will not believe in God unless after thinking.^{٣٦}

• Faith and politeness are the fruits of ‘Aql.^{٣٧}

Imam ‘Ali knew the way to get to ‘ilm, hikmah, ... through the passage of ‘Aql which has a theoretical application. Of course, as we will say in the part of “‘Aql and din” (reason and religion) are complementary of ‘Aql and there is a special relationship between them.

٢. Practical application of ‘Aql

The number of traditions regarding the practical and ethical role of ‘Aql from imam ‘Ali is more than traditions about other applications of ‘Aql. Here there are some examples:

• The perfect soul is attainable by ‘Aql.^{٣٨}

• Politeness in human being is like a tree which its root is ‘Aql.^{٣٩}

• Good temper is a fruit of ‘Aql.^{٤٠}

• ‘Aql is a tree which its fruits are generosity and modesty.^{٤١}

•The fruit of ‘Aql is getting along with people.^{٥٢}

•A person is as gentle as the extent of his ‘Aql.^{٥٣}

•‘Aql is to seek avoidance from sins.^{٥٤}

•By ‘Aql increase, patience and prudence will increase.^{٥٥}

•The fruit of ‘Aql is to be honest.^{٥٦}

•Obedience of God is to the extent of someone's ‘Aql.^{٥٧}

•Anyone whose ‘Aql is perfect his behavior is good.^{٥٨}

•Of signs of ‘Aql is to act based on justice.^{٥٩}

Therefore, ‘Aql can show us good deeds and bad deeds and perfection of people can be understood by ‘Aql.

٢. ‘Aql as a tool

Whatever which is mentioned as ‘Aql as a tool in traditions from imam ‘Ali, is different from what Hume or others said. The one that is claimed by others see ‘Aql completely avoid of any power or prudence which takes care of their everyday life to lead them to enjoyable life of this word. This ‘Aql, as it has the ability to rationalize, can empower human beings to predict future events.

The following traditions are from imam ‘Ali which assert application of ‘Aql to take care of everyday life.

•The best of people in ‘Aql is the best one of them in planning for his very day life.^{٦٠}

•The best reason for having ‘Aql is how good a person can plan.^{٦١}

•‘Aql orders you to the most beneficial.^{٦٢}

•The limitation of ‘Aql is prudence.^{٦٣}

•If someone has sound mind, he will take advantage of his opportunities.^{٦٤}

•‘Aql is true prediction and knowing future based on past.^{٦٥}

As we have seen, ‘Aql as a means for Hume and other modernists is a kind of ‘Aql which is a tool to pave the way for more pleasure. This logic is at the service of carnal desires not against it. Besides that, it is bound to the life of this world and it has nothing to do with the other world. Due to this, not only isn't it at the service of theoretical ‘Aql which proves God and religion, but also it is not the service of practical ‘Aql which clarifies good and bad deeds. In contrast, in the opinion of imam ‘Ali, this means is a tool to reach goals of theoretical and practical ‘Aql and as theoretical ‘Aql proves God, religion and hereafter and practical ‘Aql, leads human beings to observe religion and hereafter, this ‘Aql will be at the service of spirituality and hereafter and

against lust. Imam declared this trade between this definition of ‘Aql and hereafter, in some of his sayings, knew them their counterparts and said, *The best people in terms of ‘Aql are those who are better in planning for their daily life and try for their hereafter.*⁷⁷

In some traditions we read Muawiyah's scam as his mean personality and not ‘Aql⁷⁸ due to this reason. It means ‘Aql should be at the service of theatrical and practical ‘Aql which means in the path of God.

Imam ‘Ali knew the results of ‘Aql and worship of God as being pious in the world and think about hereafter. Look at these words,

- God does not worshipped by something better than ‘Aql.⁷⁹
- The wisest person is the most obedient one in front of God and the closest to God.⁸⁰
- A wise person is whom is pious in this mundane world and is eager for the awesome and elevated heaven.⁸¹
- A wise person is he who avoids carnal desires and sells this world for hereafter.⁸²

These sayings can depict the direction of this kind of ‘Aql in the teachings of imam.

4. realization of practical ‘Aql

In the works of Muslim philosophers practical ‘Aql has several meanings: the

most well known meaning of practical ‘Aql is an ability which helps human beings to quit or continue an action.

According to this, practical ‘Aql similar to theatrical ‘Aql is an ability to realize. These two ‘Aql are different in the process of recognition. The other meaning from practical ‘Aql is the ability which provokes human beings to his actions. ‘Aql in this meaning, is the same as will power. According to this, practical ‘Aql, is the power to act. They knew practical ‘Aql as it is famous of the applications of theatrical ‘Aql.

Another meaning of practical ‘Aql, is the ability which gives birth to some specific actions specified to human beings, like shame, laugh, cry. And also a comprehending power of Ahkam related to human actions.

Imam ‘Ali has various hints to practical ‘Aql which we are putting forth here:

1, 2. He in most of his speeches counted good deeds and morality as the results of ‘Aql and said human beings by their ‘Aql can reach perfection, politeness, modesty, generosity, and justice. The content of most of traditions mentioned in the part of practical applications of ‘Aql is similar to this. These traditions are true both for practical ‘Aql which means recognition and noetic and practical ‘Aql meaning ‘Aql as a tool to pass life with.

Because recognition and will power are both the prerequisite of action.

٢, ٤. In a part of imam's speech, 'Aql is the ability to comprehend. For example, in a tradition narrated from Prophet, it is said, *after the coming of age and puberty, a light will appear in his heart and after that he can understand good and bad, obligatory and advised religious practices. Truly, 'Aql in heart is like a light inside home.*'^{٧٧} Also, he said explaining about 'Aql, *a wise person is the one who realize better one between two evils.*'^{٧٨}

Therefore, 'Aql's duty is to realize the least harmful evils. Also he said, *'Aqls are leaders of thoughts, and thoughts are leaders of hearts, and hearts are leaders of senses, and senses are leaders of members of body.*'^{٧٩}

According to this, from 'Aql, though is produced, and thought will end up in action. Therefore, 'Aql has a noetic role in comparison with action. Imam Sadiq said, *servants of God realize good deeds from bad deeds by aql.*'^{٨٠}

٣, ٤ according to some traditions from imam 'Ali, 'Aql is the ability to prohibit or command and stop human beings from bad deeds. For example,

- 'Aql orders you to what is more beneficial.'^{٨١}
- Hearts have some evil thoughts which 'Aqls fade them.'^{٨٢}

- Spirits are free but 'Aqls' hands prohibit spirits from evils.'^{٨٣}

From these traditions, it is clear that 'Aql not only shows bad and good deeds to human beings but also orders or prohibits them.

It should be said that this meaning is different from practical mind (the ability to encourage or prohibit) with its not famous expressional meaning of practical 'Aql which means the ability to move. It is feasible that 'Aql orders to do an action or stop doing it, but human beings do not take this order. While if will-power tends to get an action done, it will happen.

Accordingly, the previously mentioned traditions shouldn't be applied to the non-famous expression of practical 'Aql.

٤, ٤. From imam 'Ali has been narrated that 'Aql means good deeds or avoiding bad deeds. The followings are from him:

- Truly 'Aql is avoiding sins, prudence, and being wise.'^{٨٤}
- 'Aql is to say what you know and put what you say in practice.'^{٨٥}
- 'Aql is getting experienced. And the best experience of you is what advises you.'^{٨٦}
- 'Aql is to act moderately, do not be extravagant, keep your promises, and do not break them, and when you get angry, be patient.'^{٨٧}

The other traditions which are narrated from imam ‘Ali in describing ‘Aql are similar to this application (the forth application). In these traditions, a wise person is the one who does good deeds and avoids bad deeds. Besides that, in a lot of traditions from him, we read that an ignorant person is one who does evil deeds and leaves good deeds. It is clear that a person who does bad deeds, has ‘Aql otherwise it is not his fault. Because you are responsible when you have ‘Aql. Therefore, the meaning of the mentioned traditions of a wise person is the one who has ‘Aql and acts accordingly and an ignorant person is the one who does against his ‘Aql following jahl and lust. Therefore, in the traditions from ‘Ali, we see four types of practical ‘Aql. The latter application is a virtual application and in fact it is a return to the first application. The first application is general and is collective with the other applications. Among these second and third applications are the applications of practical ‘Aql. According to these two applications, ‘Aql, can show good and bad, and orders doing good deeds and prohibits bad deeds.

‘Aql and Morality

The relationship between ‘Aql and morality is of the important discussions in the study of logic and also in the science of ethics. The discussions of “practical application of ‘Aql” and “realization of

practical mind” are related to the relationship between ‘Aql and ethics and we see that imam ‘Ali argued that ‘Aql can differ between good and bad deeds and invites human beings to do something and to stop something else. Based on this, we are pointing out to some important tips regarding the relationship between ‘Aql and ethics.

One. One of the important issues regarding relationship between ‘Aql and ethics is their mutual impacts on each other. The impact of ‘Aql on ethics was reviewed. We learned that human beings understand ethical and good or bad things according to their ‘Aql and prohibit or enjoin them, but about the impact of ethics on logic, imam ‘Ali said in various traditions, morality and good deeds are counted as tools in empowering ‘Aql and in the opposite bad deeds and sins are the tools of weakening ‘Aql. For example,

- Fight with your carnal desires, and overcome your anger, and break your bad habits to grow your soul and perfect your logic.^{۸۳}
- The one who makes himself needless of facilities of the world, makes his mind perfect.^{۸۴}
- Following carnal desires, will ruin ‘Aql.^{۸۵}
- The worst calamity of ‘Aql is arrogance.^{۸۶}
- Anger will ruin ‘Aql.^{۸۷}

- The calamity of ‘Aql is egotism.^{٨٨}
- The one whose pleasure is a lot his ‘Aql is little.^{٨٩}
- Losing ‘Aql is in being extravagant.^{٩٠}

These traditions know ‘Aql as a means to understand ethics and ethics can increase ‘Aql. From these words, we understand that ‘Aql and ethics have a mutual relationship which can not be interrupted. ‘Aql and ethics in this trade can move to perfection. Human beings with their ‘Aql can realize goodness of good deeds and badness of bad deeds. After this understanding, if they practice based on their ‘Aql, it means do good deeds more and skip bad deeds, their ‘Aql will increase and in fact they can understand good and bad more.

Likewise, if they can not act according to that ‘Aql, it means committing sins, his primary ‘Aql will weaken and eventually destroyed.

صُمْ بِكُمْ عُمِّي فَهُمْ لَا يَعْقِلُونَ

Deaf, dumb, and blind, they do not understand.(٢:١٧١)

In summary, human beings can invoke ‘Aql and ethics to help each other or to destroy both.

Second. The school of teleological and deontological theory are the most important schools in philosophy of ethics and ethics normatives. A lot of ethics

philosophers can be classified in one of these schools. According to the school of teleological theory, the criterion of an act being correct or being obligatory regarding ethics, is the non-ethical value that it causes. In another world, the action per se is not good and obligatory, but to judge about good and obligatory actions we should pay attention to the results of them.

The supporters of this school, in determining the end have different ideas, this end is pleasure for most of them and others know other things like power, noetic and perfection as the end.

Against this school is the deontological theory which some of his fans deny the criterion of end in an action being good or obligatory and some others do not know it alone. They say, the action per se regardless of its end can be good or bad or haram or wajib. Therefore, the end here, knows the end of an action the only criterion to judge; but duty here does not equal neglecting attention to the end in judgment but by accepting this meaning the act per se and its features are involved in judgment. Apparently, the content of this school is closer to the traditions of applications of practical ‘Aql in second and third applications.

According to the content of these traditions, ‘Aql can understand good or bad and do good and avoid bad deeds. Of course, in some of these traditions, ‘Aql

according to benefit order to do an action or avoid an action. But it is not always like this; and in most traditions ‘Aql can directly understand good and bad to stop human beings from bad. Therefore, specifying criterion to judge benefits or end is not true. Some actions are good or bad in their nature. ‘Aql also can at least in some cases understand these good or bad, order to them or stop them.

Third. In the interpretation of husn (goodness) or qubh (bad) of actions, there are various ideas among Islamic or non islamic elites . Muslim philosophers in this case have a famous opinion which some of Usulin agree with them. They say husn and qubh are from well-known issues among public and elites use them to run their social life. As we know well-known issues (mashhurat) are prerequisites of Qiyas Jadali. And are not regarded among intellectual issues. Ave Sina said, these are confirmed by all people, for example justice is good; as most of people agree on these kinds of things. These things have some reasons: like getting used to them since childhood, prudence, some humanistic characteristics like modesty, some ancient practices, ... According to this theory, actions in themselves have no goodness or badness. So, ‘Aql could not understand goodness or badness of actions.

In traditions from ‘Ali (p.b.u.h.) we read that according to him, ‘Aql judge about good and bad deeds, it means goodness

and badness of actions is a logical affair which human beings can understand them by contemplating over the actions.

For example, his holiness said,

من علامات العقل: العمل بسنه العدل

Of the signs of ‘Aql is act justly.

The base of this saying is goodness of justice which ‘Aql realizes it completely and invites human beings to it. Therefore, anyone who act justly, has ‘Aql and is his follower.

He said, *‘Aql stops spirits from filth.*^{٩١}

The base of this word is ugliness of evils which ‘Aql understands it.

‘Aql and religion

The relationship between ‘Aql and religion is similar to the relationship of ‘Aql and ethics. According to imam ‘Ali, ‘Aql is the way to get human beings to God and religion:

- With ‘Aql, the gnosis of God becomes stronger.^{٩٢}
- A faithful person will not believe in God unless when he comprehends by his ‘Aql.^{٩٣}
- Religion and politeness are the results of ‘Aql.^{٩٤}
- Someone’s faith is as much as his ‘Aql.^{٩٥}

•The first foundation of Islam is ‘Aql.^{١١}

‘Aql can find God through verses. After that goodness and essentiality of being surrounded to God and believing in Him are reminded to human beings. Human beings with their ‘Aql is the addressee of religion and shariah. Therefore, the basic condition for being responsible in front of religion and its Ahkam is having ‘Aql. Due to this, ‘Ali knew the amount of rewards and punishment in hereafter based on his ‘Aql:

God punishes or rewards servants of Him based on the extent of ‘Aql they are given in this world.

‘Aql draws human beings to religion and its judgment is confirmed by religion; because according to the saying of Imam ‘Ali, ‘Aql is the messenger of God. Or “‘Aql is inside shariah and shariah is outside ‘Aql.”

In some traditions, ‘Aql is as an inside proof and prophets and infallible imams are as outside proof.

From the other hand, religion also is influential in reasoning of human being and his growth and perfecting his ‘Aql. Imam ‘Ali in his first sermon of Nahj al-Balaghah said about Hikmah of messengers of God:

God appointed His messengers among His people and sent his prophets to people one after the other to revive the treaty made

before, to remind them of forgotten blessing, to reason by advertising, and declare the assets of ‘uqul (pl. ‘Aql).

His holiness in this sermon made an allegory and resembled findings of ‘Aql to hidden assets and knew one of the responsibilities of prophets revealing these assets. From this we can understand,

First: ‘Aql includes nature-bound knowledge, And in itself has a kind of knowledge which are not acquired from outside experiences.

Second, without reminding and choosing prophets human beings are ignorant from this knowledge. Prophets draw people attentions to this knowledge. Therefore, one of religion works is to put ‘Aql and nature-bound knowledge in practice. Imam said in this regard, God explained Islam... and set it as a means of belief for those who are wise. According to this tradition, religion will help wise people to reach sure belief. .

Therefore Quran always after mentioning things invites human beings to contemplate over them. This means guiding mind to a way which ends up in benefits.

As God is creator of ‘Aql knows better than anyone ‘Aql in what way can reach desired goal and which ways will not lead to goals. For example, Quran invites human beings to contemplating on Quran,

verses about universe and its order, ethical Ahkam, biography of ancient people; because the result of this thinking is recognizing God. From the other hand, in various traditions, human beings are forbidden from thinking about nature of God. Because ‘Aql is not capable of understanding nature and quality of Him. Basically, therefore, thinking in nature of God will ends up in astray. ‘Ali said in this regard,

God is greater than what ‘Aql of human beings through thinking or reasoning can understand ... do not decrease the greatness of God to the size of your mind that you will be among destroyed ones.^{٩٧}

Besides this, religion can add to ‘Aql, as imam ‘Ali said,

- Zikr and remembrance of God is the light of ‘Aql.^{٩٨}

- Anyone who remembers God, God will revive his heart and illuminate his ‘Aql and wisdom.^{٩٩}

- Remembrance of God guides ‘Aqls.^{١٠٠}

Generally, ethical actions are regarded as religious affairs and can strengthen ‘Aql, as sins weaken ‘Aql.

‘Aql and ‘ilm

The relationship between ‘Aql and ‘ilm is similar to the relationship between religion and ethics, a mutual relationship. Imam

‘Ali knew ‘Aql as the most important start in knowing human beings; i.e. the same ability which leads human being to Hikmah. They knew ‘Aql as being unmistakable and sense as possible to err and ‘Aql is sometimes introduced as leader of sense. Look at the following traditions:

- ‘Aql is the root of ‘ilm and inviter to understanding.^{١٠١}

- With ‘Aql you can reach highness of ‘ilm.^{١٠٢}

- With ‘Aql, the depth of Hikmah and with Hikmah the depth of ‘Aql can be explored.^{١٠٣}

- Thinking is not similar to seeing with eyes. Because sometimes eyes tell lies to their owners but ‘Aql does not fool anyone who wants advice.^{١٠٤}

- ‘Aql are leaders of thoughts, and thoughts are leaders of hearts, and hearts are leaders of senses and senses are leaders of members of body.^{١٠٥}

So ‘Aql is the root of ‘ilm. From the other hand, Imam ‘Ali knew ‘ilm and experience as the means and supporting factors of ‘Aql, because:

- ‘Aql is the truth which increases by ‘ilm and experience.^{١٠٦}

- ‘Ilm and knowledge increase the wisdom of its holder.^{١٠٧}

• You are evaluated based on your ‘Aql; so improve it by knowledge.^{١٠٨}

• ‘Aql is truth which is increased by experience.^{١٠٩}

• Experiences are endless and wise people grow up with them.^{١١٠}

Therefore, ‘Aql can increase ‘ilm and ‘ilm can increase ‘Aql. Human beings if use their ‘Aql more will reach more ‘ilm. Then with it can reach more ‘Aql. This is an endless way. ‘Ilm and ‘Aql are in mutual relationship helping each other’s perfection. As imam said, *‘Aql and ‘ilm will not separate.*”^{١١١}

By paying attention to some sayings of him, we realize that need of ‘ilm to ‘Aql is more than need of ‘Aql to ‘ilm; imam said,

كل علم لا يويده عقل مضله

Any ‘ilm which is confirmed by ‘Aql is going astray.

Or

Anyone whose ‘ilm overcomes his Aql, ilm will be burden.”^{١١٢}

The point is ‘ilm can be useful or useless, negative or positive. Not all kinds of them can lead to the perfection of ‘Aql.

For us who are living in modernism era, this is not something strange. That ‘ilm which its result is a weapon killing

millions of people is an ‘ilm does not accompany ‘Aql. The factor which pushes ‘ilm in its true way is ‘Aql.

If we put aside this application of ‘Aql, like Hume or liberalists, we should put carnal desires instead. Imam ‘Ali said,

‘Aql never disturbs its owner; but ‘ilm without ‘Aql is a big calamity.”^{١١٣}

In the words of ‘Ali we see a classification for ‘Aql which needs some clarification:

He said,

العقل عقلان: عقل الطبع و عقل التجربة،

و كلاهما يودى المنفعه

‘Aql is of two types: ‘Aql of Tab’ طبع and ‘Aql of experience; and both are useful.’^{١١٤}

It seems ‘Aql of Tab’ is that God given reason which is inborn and the other one which is acquired by experience.

Imam ‘Ali in some traditions said that ‘Aql is something which is given by God,

“‘Aqls are donated” or “‘Aql is inborn”

Human being has no rule in getting this ‘Aql but the other part is reachable by the will of each person. From words of imam ‘Ali, ٢٨ years old or ٣٥ years old is the due time for aql’s growth. But that ‘Aql which gained by experience can grow endlessly. Human being can grow his ‘Aql

as long as he is alive through experiencing.

The levels of ‘Aql and its relation with will power

In previous discussions, we pointed out to the levels of ‘Aql and its relationship with ‘Aql and will power. As we have seen human being has ‘Aql and lust. But he can choose one of them. And we have seen human beings by following religion or ethics and by ‘ilm and experience can grow his ‘Aql. Therefore, ‘Aql has different levels which some actions or sciences can increase it.

In the division of ‘Aql also we talked about inborn and acquired one. All these discussions are based on this that from one hand ‘Aql has several levels and from the other hand his will power in getting this different levels of ‘Aql is important.

If we would like to list some of the most important factors in increasing ‘Aql we can put these factors in the list: will power, religion, ethics, ‘ilm, experience, and age. This last factor will be discussed in the following.

Age and ‘Aql growth

Age has a role in the growth of ‘Aql. According to some traditions, human beings since his puberty, is endowed by the light of ‘Aql and realizes bad and

good. The traditions which know ‘Aql a truth from God and the criterion for giving rewards or punishment and traditions which introduce age of puberty assert this.

According to the traditions of imam ‘Ali benefiting from ‘Aql after puberty continues until getting to ٢٨ or ٣٥. After that ‘Aql growth is only possible to increase by experience.

His traditions regarding this issue are as follows:

- When a wise person grows old, his ‘Aql becomes young (i.e.stronger).^{١١٥}
- ‘Aql grows until ٢٨ years old but experiences (continue to grow after that)^{١١٦}
- ‘Aql in ٢٨ years old will reach its perfection. Whatever after that is the result of experiences.^{١١٧}
- The deadline of ‘Aql growth is ٣٥ years of age. After that (whatever adds to ‘Aql) is out of experiences.^{١١٨}

According to this, age is important in the growth of ‘Aql. It continues until ٢٨ or ٣٥ years of age and after that experiences can help the growth of ‘Aql.

End notes:

^١ ‘Amidj, Ghurarul Hikam, Sharh Khansari, vol. ١, p. ٢١, tradition, ٣٣•

- ² Fital Nisaburi, *Rudāh al-Wa'idhīn*, p. ۸; *Saduq*, *Amali*, p. ۳۱۲; *Majlisi, Bihār al-Anwar*, vol. ۱, p. ۸۳
- ³ Ibn *Fāras*, *Mu'jam Maqāiis al-Lughah*, vol. ۴, p. ۶۹
- ⁴ *ibid*
- ⁵ *Jurjani*, *al-Ta'rifat*, p. ۶۵
- ⁶ Refer to: the holy Quran, *Taha*, ۵۴, ۱۲۸
- ⁷ *Fiyumi*, *al-Misbah al-Munir*, p. ۶۳۹
- ⁸ Refer to: *Majlisi, Mirāt al-Uqul*, vol. ۱, p. ۳۷; *Sadra*, *Sharh 'Uṣul al-Kaḥfi*, vol. ۱, pp. ۳۲-۳۳۹; *Fulkiyah*, general philosophy, pp. ۷۹-۸۳
- ⁹ Refer to *Suhravardi, Majmo' Muṣannafat Shaykh Ishraq*, vol. ۲, p. ۱۳۹, ۱۵۴
- ¹ *Sadra*, *al-Hikmah al-Muta'aliyah*, vol. ۱, p. ۲۰۷; vol. ۲, p. ۳۴۶ till end; vol. ۸, p. ۳۳۳
- ¹ Refer to *Ale Imran*, ۱۹۰¹
- ¹ Refer to *Fiyumi*, *al-Misbah al-Munir*, p. ۵۴۷
- ¹ *Saduq*, *Ilal al-Sahrayeh*, p. ۴; *Tabārsi, Mishkat al-Anwar*, p. ۲۵۱; *Majlisi, Bihār al-Anwar*, vol. ۶۰, p. ۳۹۹
- ¹ 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam*, vol. ۴, p. ۵۰۴, tradition ۶۷۶۳
- ¹ *Sharif razi, Nahjul Balaghah*,⁵ *Hikmat* ۳۸; *Muttaḡhi, KANzul Umaal*, vol. ۱۶, p. ۳۶۶.
- ¹ 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam*, vol. ۲, p. ۱۳۵, tradition ۴۰۵۴
- ¹ *Ibid*, vol. ۵, p. ۲۵۵, tradition, ۸۲۲۴
- ¹ *Ibid*, vol. ۵, p. ۱۹۵, tradition ۷۹۵۳
- ¹ *Ibid*, vol. ۴, p. ۵۱۰, tradition ۶۷۹۰⁹
- ² *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۱۳۷, tradition ۳۱۰۰⁰
- ² *Ibid*, vol. ۳, p. ۱۰۱, tradition ۳۹۲۵¹
- ² *Id*, vol. ۱, p. ۸۳, tradition ۳۱۴²
- ² *Ibid*, vol. ۴, p. ۳۴۲, tradition ۳۹۵۸, vol. ۶, p. ۴۵۶, tradition ۱۰۹۸۵
- ² *Ibid*, vol. ۱, p. ۶۸, tradition ۳۶۶⁴
- ² *Ibid*, vol. ۶, p. ۵۴, tradition ۹۴۷۵⁵
- ² *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۱۳۷, tradition ۳۰۹۹⁶
- ² *Ibid*, vol. ۳, p. ۲۶۷, tradition ۴۷۶۵⁷
- ² *Sharif Razi, Nahaj al-Balaghah*,⁸ *Hikmat* ۵۴
- ² 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam*, vol. ۲, p. ۱۵۳, tradition ۳۱۵۱
- ³ *Ibid*, vol. ۱, p. ۳۳۴, tradition ۱۳۴⁰
- ³ *Kulayni*, *al-Kafi*, vol. ۱, p. ۲۱¹
- ³ Refer to : *ibid*, pp. ۲۶۴-۲۷۸²
- ³ *Copleston*, *English philosophers*,³ p. ۳۳۴-۳۳۷
- ³ 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam*, vol. ۲, p. ۱۸۴, tradition, ۳۳۱۰
- ³ *Ibid*, vol. ۱, p. ۱۳۳, traditions ۴۴۸⁵, ۴۴۹
- ³ Refer to *Copleston*, p. ۳۴۶⁶
- ³ *Ibid*, pp. ۲۴۷, ۲۴۶⁷
- ³ *Ibid*, p. ۳۴۳⁸
- ³ 'Amidi, vol. ۲, p. ۹۱, tradition ۱۹۵۹
- ⁴ *Ibid*, vol. ۵, p. ۱۲۵, tradition ۷۶۴۴⁰
- ⁴ *Kulayni*, *al-Kafi*, vol. ۱, p. ۲۸¹
- ⁴ *MIDI, ...*, VOL. ۲, P. ۴۴۲, TRADITION ۳۳۳۰
- ⁴ *Ibn Talḥah Shafi'i, Matālib al-Sulb*, p. ۵۰
- ⁴ *Ibn Shubah, Tuḥaf al-Ughul*, p. ۶۲; *Mufid*, *al-Amali*, p. ۲۵۴; *Saduq, Al-Tawḥid*, p. ۲۵
- ⁴ *Al-Kafi*, vol. ۱, p. ۱۴۱⁵
- ⁴ 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam* vol. ۶, p. ۶۷۰, tradition 9553
- ⁴ *Ibn Razi, jami' al-Aḥadith*, p. ۱۳۶⁷
- ⁴ 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam*, vol. ۲, p. ۳۳۴, tradition ۴۳۱۸
- ⁴ *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۱۰۹, tradition ۳۰۰۴⁹
- ⁵ *ibid*, vol. ۱, p. ۳۳۹, tradition ۱۲۸۰⁰
- ⁵ *Ibid*, vol. ۱, p. ۳۳۹, tradition ۱۲۵۴¹
- ⁵ *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۳۲۹, tradition ۴۶۲۹²
- ⁵ *Ibid*, vol. ۶, p. ۱۲۸, tradition ۹۷۷۷³
- ⁵ *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۸۴, tradition ۳۸۸۷⁴
- ⁵ *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۲۲۱, tradition ۴۲۷۴⁵
- ⁵ *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۲۲۲, tradition ۴۶۴۴⁶
- ⁵ *Ibid*, vol. ۴, p. ۳۱۲, tradition ۶۱۷۸⁷
- ⁵ *Saduq*, *al-Khisal*, p. ۶۳۳⁸
- ⁵ 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam*, vol. ۶, p. ۴۴, tradition ۹۴۳۰
- ⁶ *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۴۷۲, tradition ۳۳۴۰⁰
- ⁶ *Ibid*, vol. ۲, p. ۴۳۹, tradition ۳۱۵۱¹
- ⁶ *Abi, Nathr al-dur*, vol. ۱, p. ۲۸۵²
- ⁶ 'Amidi, *Ghurarul Hikam*, vol. ۲, p. ۴۰۴, tradition ۴۹۰۱
- ⁶ *Ibid*, vol. ۵, p. ۱۱۲, tradition ۷۵۷۹⁴

- ⁶ Ibn Abi al-Ḥajjīd, sharh Nahaj al – Balaghah, vol. ٢٠, p. ٣٣١
- ⁶ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ٢٧٢, tradition ٣٣٢
- ⁶ Al-kāfi, vol. ١, p. ١١ ⁷
- ⁶ Ibid, p. ١٨ ⁸
- ⁶ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, pp. ٢٦٨, ٢٢٢, traditions, ٣٣٨, ٣١٢
- ⁷ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ٢٨, tradition ١٨٢ ⁰
- ⁷ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ٢٢, tradition ١٧٢ ¹
- ⁷ Saduq, ilal, p. ٩٨; Majlisi, Bihār al-Anwar, vol. ١, p. ٩٩
- ⁷ Ibn Ṭalḥa shafi’i, Matālib al-Su’l, p. ٢٩
- ⁷ Karājī, kanzul fuad, vol. ١, p. ٢٠٠; Majlisi, Bihār al-Anwar, vol. ١, p. ٩٢
- ⁷ Al-kāfi, vol. ١, p. ٢٩ ⁵
- ⁷ Abi, Nathr al-dur, vol. ١, p. ٢٥٨ ⁶
- ⁷ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٥, p. ٣١, tradition ٧٣٢
- ⁷ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ١١٩, tradition. ٢٠٢٨
- ⁷ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ٨٢, tradition ٢٨٧ ⁹
- ⁸ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ١٥٠, tradition ٢١٢ ⁰
- ⁸ ¹
- ⁸ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ١٢٥, tradition ٢١٢
- ⁸ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ٢٢٥, tradition ٢٧٢
- ⁸ Ibid, vol. ٥, p. ٢٩٢, tradition ٨٩٠ ⁴
- ⁸ Karājī, kanz, vol. ١, p. ١٩٩ ⁵
- ⁸ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ١٢٥, tradition ٥٥٢
- ⁸ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ١٧٨, tradition ٥٧٢ ⁷
- ⁸ Ibid, vol. ١, p. ٢٥٧, tradition ١٢٥ ⁸
- ⁸ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ١٠٩, tradition ٢٩٥ ⁹
- ⁹ Ibid, vol. ٥, p. ٢٩٢, tradition ٨٢٢ ⁰
- ⁹ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ١١٩, tradition ٢٠٢٨ ¹
- ⁹ Ibn Shu’ba, Tuḥaf ‘Ughul, p. ٢٢, Mufīd, Amālī, p. ٢٥٢; Saduq, al-tuhid, p. ٢٥
- ⁹ Karājī, kanzul fuad, vol. ١, p. ٥٢ ³
- ⁹ Ibn Rāzī, Jame’ al-Aḥādīth, p. ١٢٢
- ⁹ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ٢١٢, no: ٢٨٢
- ⁹ Ibn Shu’ba, Tuḥaf, p. ١٩٢ ⁶
- ⁹ Saduq, al- *Al-Tawḥīd*, pp. ٥١-٥٢
- ⁹ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ١٠٨, no. ٩٩٩
- ⁹ Ibid, vol. ٥, p. ٢٨٧, no. ٨٧٢ ⁹
- ¹ Ibid, vol. ١, p. ٢٢٩, no. ١٢٠ ⁰
- ¹ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ٩١, no. ١٩٥ ⁰
- ¹ Ibn Ṭalḥa, Matālib al-Su’l, p. ٢٩ ⁰
- ¹ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ٢٠٢, no: ٢٢٠ ^٨
- ¹ Ibid, vol. ٥, p. ٨٢, no. ٧٢٢ ⁰
- ¹ Ibn Shu’ba, Tuḥaf, p. ٢٢٢ ⁰
- ¹ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ٢٢, no. ٩٧١ ^٨
- ¹ Majlisī, Bihār al-Anwar, vol. ٧, p. ٢٢
- ¹ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ٥٧, no. ٢٨١ ^٢
- ¹ Ibn abīl Ḥadīd, sharh Nahaj al-Balaghah, vol. ٢٠, p. ٢٢١
- ¹ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ١, p. ٢٩٧, nb. ١٥٢
- ¹ Ibid, vol. ٢, p. ٢٢, no. ١٧٨ ¹
- ¹ Ibid, vol. ٥, p. ٢٢٩, no. ٨٢٠ ¹
- ¹ Ibn Abi Ḥadīd, sharh Nahaj al-Balaghah, vol. ٢٠, p. ٢٢٢
- ¹ Ibn Ṭalḥa, Matālib al-Su’l, p. ٢٩ ¹
- ¹ Ghurarul Hikam, vol. ٢, p. ١٩٢, nb. ٢١٢
- ¹ Al-kāfi, vol. ٧, p. ٢٧ ¹
- ¹ Ibn Ash’ath, al-Jafariyat, p. ٢١٢ ¹
- ¹ Saduq, Kitāb man lā yaḥdḥuruhul faqīh, vol. ٢, p. ٢٩٢