

Keywords: *Sanad Bahrani, Muhammad; Islam Ma'iyat al- Thaqalayn lil-Islam al-Mushaf Munsikhan Min al-Hadith , Mutashabihat and Muhkamat, Ahl-e-Tathir, 'Ilm al-Hadith, kinds of revelation, Qur'an's interpretation, infallibles.*

Introduction

More than a century ago, a stream of thought came to be known as "Ahl- Zikr and al-Qur'an." They rely only on the Holy Qur'an, and they know the Hadith applicable only to those who lived in the age of the Prophet (peace be upon him), and do not consider it to related to the Muslims of the next century. ((Elahi-Bakhsh Al-Quraniyun, pp. 19-21)

This approach is taken against the extremes of Ahl al-Hadith. They are, for the sake of doubts applying to purely "attaching to hadiths" turned into "purely attaching to Quran". The comprehensiveness of the Holy Quran, under the pretext of "حسبنا كتاب الله" (the Book of God is enough for us), the non-revelation nature of tradition, the defects in the texts and the documents of the Hadith, are among the most important doubts that have led them to depart from the authority and validity of Sunnah

(Ibid., Pp. 202-256) , except for other factors that have contributed to the emergence of this thinking. (Ibid., Pp. 22-35)

Reactions to this tendency have varied. On the one hand, scholars of other Islamic faiths at the same time issued severe fatwas for their Takfir, and on the other hand, those in Egypt wrote articles in support of them which followed by criticizing. (Jebreili, A Survey of Contemporary Kalam Thought, p. 305)

This group, which accepted only the authority of the Qur'an, disagreed on the scope of Ahkam and duties. Some consider the Qur'an to be sufficient in all matters – including obligatory, advised (Mustahabat), or Mubahithat. Others have given the responsibility of deducing Quran's lessons to "Markaz al-Milah".

Quraniyun or Ahl al-Qur'an, in addition to their commonalities with other

Muslims, have specific beliefs or contrary believes to Muslim consensus. These are the denial of intercession, denial of the life in Barzakh, denial of Naskh in the Qur'an, and the denial of any miracle for the Prophet of Islam and the denial of the absolute infallibility of the Prophet. (Ibid., P. 306-307)

In the practical Furu' also there are some differences: for example, in the details of prayer, despite the internal difference the number of daily prayers for them ranges from three to six prayers, the number of rak'ahs between two and four, the days of fasting which they consider to be 30 days and one month, but it is not necessary to do it in Ramadan. (Ibid., P. 307)

One of the scholars who has evaluated this group's views over the past three years is Ayatollah Sheikh Mohammad Sanad Bahrani. Now, we first get to know his personality, then introduce his book that is the result of his lectures on this subject.

Author introduction

Mohammad Sanad Bahrani was born in Bahrain in the 1382 lunar year. He studied engineering at a London university for a while, but then entered the Qom Hauzah with the victory of the Iran revolution in 1357 the solar year. He attended the classes Kharij Fiqh and 'Usul of Sheikh Murteza Haeri, Mirza Hashem Amuli, Golpayegani, Seyed Mohammad Rohani, Vahid Khorasani, Tabrizi and Fani Esfahani. He also used the lessons of the masters of philosophy of Hasan zadeh, Javadi and Ansari Shirazi.

Ayatollah Mohammad Sanad Bahrani has dozens of books and articles, including: Al-Imamah al-Ilahiyah, Da'va al-Sifarah fi Al-Ghiba Al-Kubra, Buhuth fi Mabani 'Ilm al-Rijal, al-'Aql al-'Amali, Fiqh al-Banuk, Minhaj al-Salihin, Fiqh al-Masarif val Nuqud, fi Ruhab al-Ziyarah al-Jami'at al-Kabirah, Maqamat Fatimah al-Zahra fi al-Kitab val Sunnah, 'Adalah al-Sahabah, Tafsir Malahim al-Muhkamat.

He has been teaching and researching in the Qom Hauzah for many years. He has

recently resided in Najaf and teaches Kharij Fiqh and 'Uṣul in the Hauzah of Najaf. Along with these two lessons, he teaches some hadith and doctrinal books. One of his works is a book entitled "*Islam Ma'iyat al- Thaqaalayn*", which is recorded by Ehsan Mozafar and will be reviewed in the following.

Introduction of the Book

Before introducing parts of this book, we pointed out to some parts of this book which are mentioned in introduction that Ehsan Mozafar has cited for the audience for their better understanding.

In this introduction, he explores the necessity of discussing Quraniyun in several respects. Beginning his discussion with the historical approach of the prohibition of writing hadith, he described the reason of this command by the second caliph his unfamiliarity with the hadith of the Prophet and, subsequently, his performance which led to doubts of the Islamic Ummah about his scientific jurisdiction as a caliph.

On the other hand, the lack of writing hadith caused him and others to pursue ijtiḥad without knowledge which led to the discontent of the companions of Prophet. Thus, he started fining and imprisoning hadith narrators.

With this approach of the second caliph, ijtiḥad and personal opinion, along with the Qur'an and hadith, became the third principle in Islamic law, and this led to the divisions among the Islamic Ummah, a group had adopted Shari'ah from the text of Qur'an and Sunnah, and a second group from Ijtiḥad of Sheikhs by this belief that there is no more knowledgeable person than them. Therefore, the domain of ijtiḥad was gradually widened.

The tendency that receives the Shari'ah from the texts of the Quran and the Sunnah simultaneously, in the school of Ahl al-Bayt became manifested in this way that some of the companions of the Prophet (peace be upon him) and the companions of the Imams started to compile hadith of Prophet and Ahlul Bayt, so the issue of forbiddance of

recording hadith did not stop their movement.

Followers of the Ahl al-Bayt School:

Over the course of three centuries, they have compiled more than 6,600 books preserved names of their writers; then, the Shiite ‘Arba’ books were penned which are among the most accurate, authentic, and most exact books of the Imamiyah hadith books. However, the role of other books such as the book of Salim ibn Qais Hilali, al-Mu'min Hussein ibn Sa'id Ahwazi, Navader 'Isa Ash'ari, and al-Mahassin Barqi in preserving the legacy of traditions of Imams cannot be ignored.

With all this effort and writing, some voices have arisen for a while that do not accept the authority of this great legacy. Some believe that a large part of this great legacy is from the Ka'b al-Ahbar and a substantial part of it is Israeliyat; these groups out of their ignorance are hurting the principles of religion and raise doubts in the Shari'ah of the Prophet.

In the final section of the introduction, he warns the reader that Sheikh Mohammad rejected these remarks, and in response to these doubts, enriched his argument on the basis of Qur'anic reasons and prophetic traditions.

Introducing the Book's section

The book “*Islam Ma'iyat al-Thaqalayn*” has been categorized in twenty-eight sessions, each session about a topic.

The titles of the chapters of the book are as follows:

Chapter 1- checking the Mutashabihat of the Quran and Sunnah to Muhkamat.

Chapter 2 - Interpretation of Mutashabihat and Muhkamat by the Qur'an.

Chapter 3 - The Book and the 'Itrah, Two Divine ropes or one rope?

Chapter 4-Interpretation (Ta'vil) by Ahl Tathir.

Chapter 5- checking Ta'vil by hadith or the opposite?

Chapter 6 – knowledge of Ahl al-Zikr of Qur'an.

Chapter 7. Guardians of the Qur'an.

Chapter 8. Fallacy in the slogan of "Qur'anic Islam"

Chapter 9 - Some doubts and their answers.

Chapter 10 - Islam in accompany of Thaqaalayn, not based on one of them.

Chapter 11- The Hierarchy of Nezamat barahin.

Chapter 12 - Examples of the Qur'an about the system of proofs (Nezamat barahin) and their hierarchies.

Chapter 13 - Some Rules of 'Ilm Al-Hadith.

Chapter 14 – Organizing the Book of Salim bin Qais Hilali.

Chapter 15 - Types of Revelation.

Chapter 16- Accompanying the beliefs with the science of jurisprudence.

Chapter 17 - The Difference Between Intellectual Heritage in the School of Ahlul-Bayt or the School of Caliphate.

Chapter 18 – the meaning of The Book of Karim.

Chapter 19- perfecting was by the religion of the Prophet or the Qur'an or Ali?

Chapter 20 – Regulations of Israiliyat.

Chapter 21- Israiliyat in the Sunni Intellectual Heritage.

Chapter 22- Israiliyat in the Philosophy of Mysticism.

Chapter 23- "Zikr" between the Qur'an and Sunnah.

Chapter 24- Hadith between Scientific and Ta'budi Authority

Chapter 25 - The Importance of Accepting the Facts in the Revelational Intellectual Heritage.

Chapter 26 - Factors of Distortion in Religion.

Chapter 27-Correcting and rearranging hadith sources, a defective claim against the correct methods of al-Dirayah and Fiqh al-Hadith.

Chapter 28- The narration of hadith sources could have been possible except with the help of both memories of the Prophet.

Sheikh Mohammad Sanad, in just two or three chapters at the beginning of the discussion, presents the Quraniyun perspective, but throughout this book seeks to present Quranic and sunnah reasons to prove the necessity of using knowledge of Ahl al-Bayt to understand Quran. In its continuation, some of the sessions of this book and Sheikh Mohammad Sanad's responses to Quraniyun are reported in detail.

Checking the Qur'an Mutashabihat and the Sunnah with Muhkamat

In the first Majlis, he put forward the Quraniyun's view that *Checking the*

Qur'an Mutashabihat and the Sunnah with Muhkamat should be performed and they consider this by traditions being the interpreter of verses, because there are two distinct states: if the intention is the appearance of the Qur'an, it does not need interpreter. But if the intention is inward of Quran and the traditions are needed to understand them, it is strange! Because ***Mutashabihat*** of the traditions have to be presented to the Qur'an and, on the other hand, the Qur'an itself needs traditions to be understood.

He gives the answer that we briefly quote here:

1. ***Mutashabihat*** of the Qur'an and Sunnah are presented to total set of Muhkamat of Qur'an and Sunnah. In other words, ***Mutashabihat*** of the Qur'an, Sunnah, reason and conscience are presented to Muhkamat of the Qur'an, Sunnah, reason and conscience.
2. In each of these four cases, both Muhkam and Mutashabih have ranks and levels.

3. The Qur'an and 'Itrah are two aspects of the same truth. Every book needs a teacher and for the Qur'an as a divine book, a divine teacher is appointed by God.

4. The companionship of the book and the hadith is of the levels of Thaqalayn and Thaqalayn has also a hierarchy; Quran has levels of Gheibi, Malakuti and Ta'vili and there is no way to recourse it without accompanying of 'Itrah.

To the end of his discussions, Sheikh Mohammad Sanad has tried to explain "the companionship of the Qur'an and the 'Itrah". This style is followed throughout the book.

Muhkamat and Mutashabihat in the Book of God

In the second chapter, in rejecting the Qur'an sufficiency, Sanad refers to the seventh verse of Sura Ale 'Imran, which considers the Qur'an to have two groups of Muhkamat and Mutashabihat verses and explains the need for Ahlul-Bayt narratives to identify and interpret

Muhkamat and Mutashabihat verses. He says:

1. The Holy Quran states that those who only resort to the Qur'an are misled and deceived.

Anyone who does not believe that the Qur'an has Ta'vil, does not accept the Qur'an, and anyone who does not believe that Ta'vil is limited to the divine science and *Rasekhan* in science has denied the Qur'an.

2. The Holy Qur'an considers the attainment of the hidden truths of the Unseen to be unique to those for whom Quran testifies to their divine cleansing. In Surat Ale 'Imran: " وَمَا يَعْلَمُ تَأْوِيلَهُ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَ " (Al-Imran, 7) Then God says in Surah Vaqi'ah after swearing to the Book, "فِي كِتَابٍ مَّكْنُونٍ* لَا " (78-79). Both verses confirm the content of hadith Thaqalayn and companionship of these two. Quran is known as a divine book that has divine unseen levels. Attaining these levels and understanding them are impossible for every one even religious

jurisprudence. Only Ahl Bayt can reach that level that Quran testifies to their purity.

3. Therefore interpretation of interpreters, scholars , ... can not replace narrations of infallibles.

4. God says, " وَلَوْ أَنَّ مَا فِي الْأَرْضِ مِنْ شَجَرَةٍ أَقْلَامٌ وَ الْبَحْرُ يَمُدُّهُ مِنْ بَعْدِهِ سَبْعَةُ أَبْحُرٍ مَا نَفِدَتْ كَلِمَاتُ اللَّهِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزِيزٌ حَكِيمٌ. " (Luqman, 27)

According to this verse, divine words do not end because the divine words is an unseen infinite celestial. Therefore it can not be surrounded by human power, and no commentator can encompass the Quran unless those for whom Quran testifies they understand and feel the Quran; because Quran is a divine book and needs a divine teacher appointed by God who are Ahlul Bayt.

Interpretation is for the Ahl-e Tathir

In the fourth session, focusing on some verses of the Holy Quran, he considers the position of interpretation of the verses to be exclusively for the Ahlul-Bayt. He argues:

1. The Holy Quran has given the position of interpretation of the meanings of the Qur'an to *Rasikhan* in science and has mentioned it in numerous verses:

«...وَمَا يَعْلَمُ تَأْوِيلَهُ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَالرَّاسِخُونَ فِي الْعِلْمِ... (Ale 'Imran)

«بَلْ هُوَ آيَاتٌ بَيِّنَاتٌ فِي صُدُورِ الَّذِينَ أُوتُوا الْعِلْمَ»

('Ankabut, 49)

In the first verse, God gives the responsibility of Ta'vil of Mutashabihat to Rasikhan in science and in the second verse talks about companionship of Thaqaalayn.

و “ (Qiyamat, 19) ثُمَّ إِنَّ عَلَيْنَا بَيَانَهُ 2. ”يُعَلِّمُهُمُ الْكِتَابَ وَالْحِكْمَةَ (Baqarah, 129) and the verses like this reveals the responsibility that no one has except the holy Prophet. This is a divine responsibility which roots in unseen.

3. Ahlul Bayt: in Hadith Thaqaalayn Ahlul Bayt are mentioned as a rope that people should grasp it so as not to be mislead. One head of it is in the

hand of God and according to Him, Ta'vil of Quran is with Ahlul Bayt.

Surroundings of the Ahl Zikr to Zikr

Sanad in the sixth session knows Ahlul bayt the only ones who have the science of Quran.

«وَلَوْ أَنَّمَا فِي الْأَرْضِ مِنْ شَجَرَةٍ أَقْلَامٌ وَالْبَحْرُ يَمُدُّهُ مِنْ بَعْدِهِ سَبْعَةُ أَبْحُرٍ مَا نَفِدَتْ كَلِمَاتُ اللَّهِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ عَزِيزٌ حَكِيمٌ»

(Luqman, 27)

Which commentator can write a commentary that surrounds a drop of this vast sea? This is possible only for those who have a divine connection and who have understood and felt the Qur'an by the testimony of the Divine Word. This is a judgment of reason.

2. The Qur'an explicitly explains the spiritual lineage with the Prophet (peace be upon him) and the Prophet Ahlul Bayt (peace be upon him) in the Sura al-Ghadr, in a way that depicts their relation to heaven and what is

with God; by sending down Great night which happens in Qadr night, or even every Friday, or every day, or every moment ... to them. God says in Surat an-Nahl :

«يُنَزِّلُ الْمَلَائِكَةَ بِالرُّوحِ مِنْ أَمْرِهِ عَلَى مَنْ يَشَاءُ مِنْ عِبَادِهِ... (Nahl, 2)

He also in surah Shura says,

وَكَذَلِكَ أَوْحَيْنَا إِلَيْكَ رُوحاً مِّنْ أَمْرِنَا مَا كُنْتَ تَدْرِي مَا الْكِتَابُ وَلَا الْإِيمَانُ وَلَكِنْ جَعَلْنَاهُ نُوراً نَّهْدِي بِهِ مَنْ نَّشَاءُ مِنْ عِبَادِنَا

(Shura, 52)

Here the meaning of مَنْ نَّشَاءُ مِنْ عِبَادِنَا is not the prophets, but rather slaves after Prophet that God has placed them as the heirs of the spirit which is the hidden truth of the Holy Quran. In this mysterious truth, there is everything that links the earth to heaven to the level of closeness to Divine.

Then, once again, His Excellency states that the Qur'an is in the form of a mysterious book and the Ahl al-Bayt

have felt it and have come to understand it:

وَالَّذِي أَوْحَيْنَا إِلَيْكَ مِنَ الْكِتَابِ هُوَ الْحَقُّ مُصَدِّقاً لِّمَا بَيْنَ يَدَيْهِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ بِعِبَادِهِ لَخَبِيرٌ بَصِيرٌ* ثُمَّ أَوْرَثْنَا الْكِتَابَ الَّذِينَ اصْطَفَيْنَا مِنْ عِبَادِنَا

Therefore, no commentator could be rival of Ahl al-Bayt in the interpretation, Ta'vil, and explanation of this book.

5.3. Fallacy in the slogan of "Quranic Islam"

In the eighth part, the author refers to the fallacy that Islam is the same as the Qur'an or Mushaf, which resembles the slogan of "حسبنا كتاب الله", in response to this fallacy, he said,

The Qur'an "without the interpretation of the Ahlul-Bayt is subjective, restricted and possible to err – so how can it be called Islam introduced by Quran?

The one who put forth the slogan of "حسبنا كتاب الله" was a deceitful man. Is the book separable from those who

belonged to it and are allowed to touch it? This is like claiming the interpretation of the Qur'an by the Qur'an that they believe that one should only use the Qur'an to understand the Qur'an, and in the Ijtihadi interpretation, the commentator may be right or wrong.

This slogan separates Thaqaalayn from one another, while the prophet in the Mutavattir hadith of Thaqaalayn, knows the Quran and the Ahl al-Bayt with each other. It is clear that the companionship is not oral one, but a genuine one. Hence the spoken Qur'an is the Ahl al- Bayt.

A corner of the weights of 'Ilm al-Hadiths

In the thirteenth part, he deals with some of the subjects of 'Ilm al-hadith. The author attributes the approach of some to identifying the weak hadith as a reason of some pessimistic opinions about the whole hadiths and abandoning them. The reason for such

an approach is not to know some terminology of 'Ilm al-Hadith accurately. He also believes that many pests of the narrative must be accurately identified, without going to extremes, and based on scientific principles, not slogans and misleading titles.

1. He begins his explanation with two definitions of the weak hadith, the first the more commonly used is: "The weak hadith is a narrative that is not qualified of conditions of credited united news and, for the researcher, a trait of authenticity for the chain of its narrators can not be verified.

2. The second definition for the weak hadith - used less- is: "A narrative which is inflicted by Dass and Vaz". This definition applies to a hadith when for the researcher by the evidence Vaz' and Dass (to decrease or increase or change the text of the hadith) is verified.

3. Many people confuse the two with the assumption that any weak hadith is

fake. Therefore, the legend of tradition must be eradicated from such narratives; the confusion between these two is a great calamity, because the poor news in the first sense lacks the credibility of a single news, but with the evidence it can be credited and perhaps the content of it may reach Tavatur or Istifazah.

4. Investigating and cleansing the Shia Narrative Heritage have been many performed several times in the history of Imamiyyah narrators: over the course of about three centuries and afterwards the great Shiite scholars have played an important role in preserving and editing this legacy of such narrations, while none of the Islamic religions or any other religion or school of thoughts does not have such a purification and examination of its own hadiths as much as those of the Ahl al-Bayt.

Kinds of revelation

Sheikh Sanad deals with kinds of revelations in the fifteenth part, with the aim of saying that those who believe in the Qur'an sufficiency are unaware of the interpretation of the Holy Qur'an, which was given in the form of a non- Tashri' revelation to the Prophet and then to the Ahlul Bayt (peace be upon him) while the Quran has not been abandoned without interpretation.

He puts it this way:

1.The prophetic tradition preserved by the infallibles is the same revelation that Gabriel brought to Prophet Muhammad, either directly or indirectly, as is now available in Mushaf. But it should be said that revelation is not limited to the Holy Quran, but is a sacred hadith of divine Word are also revelation, while it is not Mushaf. This is stated by the noble verse:

مَا ضَلَّ صَاحِبُكُمْ وَ مَا غَوَى * وَ مَا يَنْطِقُ عَنِ
الْهَوَى * إِنْ هُوَ إِلَّا وَحْيٌ يُوحَى (Najm 2-4)

How can one resort to the Qur'an but abandon other types of revelation?

2.The revelation which contains the interpretation of the Holy Qur'an also has such conditions, it means it cannot be abandoned. The verses and traditions have repeatedly stated that the Holy Quran has an interpretation that is revealed every year on the Night of Qadr, so the interpretation (Ta'vil) of the Quran is also a revelation.

The Qur'an's revelation and its interpretation are equal so one who believes in the Qur'an's revelation, but does not accept the Qur'anic interpretation, which has also been revealed by Allah Almighty is the addressee of this verse which says, الَّذِينَ جَعَلُوا الْقُرْآنَ عِضِينَ (Hujr, 91)

Allah Almighty has given the responsibility of talking about Tanzil and Mushaf to the Prophet and Ahlul Bayt who are related to him

in science and revelation, as stated in these verses:

«أَنْزَلْنَا إِلَيْكَ الذِّكْرَ لِتُبَيِّنَ لِلنَّاسِ مَا نُزِّلَ إِلَيْهِمْ وَ لَعَلَّهُمْ يَتَفَكَّرُونَ» (Nahl, 44)

هُوَ الَّذِي بَعَثَ فِي الْأُمِّيِّينَ رَسُولًا مِنْهُمْ يَتْلُوا عَلَيْهِمْ آيَاتِهِ وَ يُزَكِّيهِمْ وَ يُعَلِّمُهُمُ الْكِتَابَ وَ الْحِكْمَةَ (Jumua', 2)

Teaching meanings and truth of Quran is the responsibility of Prophet that God has given him so interpretation of Mushaf deserves God. Of course regarding Ahlul Bayt: revelation includes Tafsir of the Book and not Tashri'i revelation. In this meaning and basis, revelation to Prophet and Ahlul Bayt have been come.

Therefore, how the Mushaf claimed by Quraniyun – without revelational expression for verses can be true? God says, وَ مَا أَنْزَلْنَا عَلَيْكَ الْكِتَابَ إِلَّا لِتُبَيِّنَ لَهُمُ الَّذِي وَ اخْتَلَفُوا فِيهِ (Nahl, 64)

It is clear that the Qur'an is not limited to the revelation of verses, but on the other side of the coin

is interpretation of the verses. This Ta'vil has come in the verses and narrations from the Ahlul-Bayt. It is in fact reminiscent of the words of the Prophet, peace be upon him, who said,

إِنِّي تَارِكٌ فِيكُمْ الثَّقَلَيْنِ كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَ عِترتي...

Prophet by this saying clarified the source and end of the Book and 'Itrah. The Book and 'Itrah starts from him and ends in him.

To be succinct, we suffice to report of the seven parts of this book.

References

1. Sanad, Muhammad. *Islam Ma'iyat al-Thaqalayn lil Islam al-Mushaf Munsikhan An al-Hadith*, Qum, Dar al-Kukh, First Edition, 2014.
2. Elahi Bakhsh, Khadim Hussein, *Al-Quraniyun and Shubahatehim Hawl al-Sunni*, Taif.1421 AH.
3. Jebraili, Mohammad Safar, *A Survey on Contemporary Kalami Thought*, Tehran, Institute of Islamic Culture and Thought, First Edition, 1391.